



PAKISTAN JOURNAL OF MASS COMMUNICATION

Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets: A Corpus-Based Discourse Analysis

Zameer Hassan

Framing of Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) in Pakistani English Leading Newspapers:

A Historic Regime Change Movement

Dr. Aqsa Iram Shahzadi, Ayesha Nawaz and Faisal Rehman

Book Review, Manufacturing Consent: United States Control on Main Stream Media (Propaganda Model Perspective)

Muhammad Kaqbad Alam, Dr. Faisal Aziz and Sahrish Rahmat

Adaptation of Digital Tools in Higher Education Institutes: A Review Paper

Asim Razzaq

Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan

Ali Ab Ul Hassan, Moona Fazal and Syed Hussain Sajjad Rizvi

PAKISTAN JOURNAL OF MASS COMMUNICATION (PJMC)

Vol. 1 Issue 1 (Jan – June 2024)

Editor-in-Chief

Prof. Dr. Shahzad Ali

Editorial Team

| | |
|-------------------|--------------------|
| Dr. Samia Manzoor | (Associate Editor) |
|-------------------|--------------------|

| | |
|-------------------|--------------------|
| Dr. Aasima Safdar | (Associate Editor) |
|-------------------|--------------------|

Advisory Board

International Members

| |
|--|
| <p>Prof. Dr. Stuart Allan Professor of Journalism and Communication Cardiff School of Journalism and Cultural Studies Wales, United Kingdom</p> |
| <p>Prof. Dr. Shahira Fahmi University of Arizona School of Journalism Tucson, USA</p> |
| <p>Prof Dr. Simon Cottle Cardiff University School of Journalism, Media and Culture Wales, United Kingdom</p> |
| <p>Prof. Dr. Nilüfer Pembecioglu Department of Radio, Television and Cinema Istanbul University, Turkey</p> |
| <p>Dr. Norisha Abdul Hamid Associate Professor Department of Media Studies University Utara Malaysia, Malaysia</p> |

Advisory Board

National Members

| |
|---|
| Dr. M. Zafar Iqbal Professor / Dean FSS Department of Media and Communication Studies International Islamic University, Islamabad |
| Prof. Dr Muhammad Khalid School of Creative Arts University of Lahore (UOL), Lahore |
| Dr. Saqib Riaz Professor/Chairman Department of Mass Communication Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad |
| Dr. Zahid Yousaf Chairman Department of Mass Communication, University of Gujrat, Gujrat |
| Dr. Anjum Zia Dean School of Media and Communication Studies University of Management and Technology, Lahore |

Pakistan Journal of Mass Communication (PJMC)

Pakistan Journal of Mass Communication is a multidisciplinary, bi-annual, and blind-reviewed publication available online and in print. The Institute of Media and Communication Studies (IMCS), Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan planned to publish this journal in 2020. PJMC is addressed to the national and international scholarly community; it seeks to reflect various intellectual traditions in communication to promote debate and dialogue among them.

Scope and Mission

PJMC accepts research papers, critical essays, and book reviews related to communication worldwide. In the pursuit of this objective, we encourage empirical, theoretical, and methodological research papers that can contribute to the advancement of communication studies as a multi-disciplinary field. PJMC firmly believes in the cumulative nature of productive knowledge. Hence, we especially encourage research papers based on systematic reviews, meta-analyses, and synthesis from diverse resources. The journal promotes research on the work connected with media, communication, politics, religion, history, sociology, economy, new media, advertising, and special emphasis on Pakistan.

Areas of Research

We suggest the following broader areas of research:‘

- Media and society
- Media and political economy
- Online journalism
- Development & communication
- Gender & communication
- International communication
- Media and Religion
- Media and violence
- Social media
- War, conflict, and communication
- Media and politics
- Media and psychology
- Media and politics
- Media and literature/language

Table of Contents

| Articles | Pages |
|---|-------|
| Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets: A Corpus-Based Discourse Analysis <i>Zameer Hassan</i> | 1-21 |
| Framing of Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) in Pakistani English Leading Newspapers, A Historic Regime Change Movement <i>Dr. Aqsa Iram Shahzadi, Ayesha Nawaz, and Faisal Rehman</i> | 22-38 |
| Book Review, Manufacturing Consent: United States Control on Main Stream Media (Propaganda Model Perspective) <i>Muhammad Kaqbad Alam, Dr. Faisal Aziz, and Sahrish Rahmat</i> | 39-53 |
| Adaptation of Digital Tools in Higher Education Institutes: A Review Paper <i>Asim Razzaq</i> | 54-67 |
| Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan <i>Ali Ab Ul Hassan, Moona Fazal and Syed Hussain Sajjad Rizvi</i> | 68-90 |
| Authors' Guidelines | 91-92 |

Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets: A Corpus-Based Discourse Analysis

Zameer Hassan

Department of Science and Technology Communication and Policy

School of Humanities and Social Science,

University of Science and Technology of China

Abstract

This article uses Corpus-Assisted Discourse analysis to examine the image construction of the One Belt, One Road Initiative in the United States media outlets. A sample of news reports by “The New York Times” and “Associated Press,” between 23rd, 2015 to August 31, 2019, were collected from the LexisNexis Database. Corpus Discourse Analysis was applied to discover the Belt and Road Initiative's representation using corpus AntConc software. Keywords examination rejoiced a complete inclination of the Media in the representation of the initiative. This study investigated the themes in the selected corpora after comparing concordance lines linked with the Belt and Road. New York Times constructed negative attributes as a new military & regional threat, a new imperialist communist state, and a militant & obstructive force. In contrast, the Associated Press gives more vitality to the debt concerns, bribing to get the different infrastructure projects, aggressiveness, and new obstructive force in the form of Belt and Road. The paper concludes with the recommendation that China should develop globally-minded media practices to present its stance on BRI.

Keywords: CDA, United States, China, The New York Times, image construction, US Newspapers, One Belt One Road Initiative,

Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets

Introduction

In the 21st century, China set its mind on financial expansion and became one of the fastest-growing economies. China has progressively been involved in economic globalization, focusing on the economic stratagem to tie and organize the trade in the African, Asian, and European financial sectors into one economic zone. In 2013, Chinese President Xi Jinping announced a strategic and cooperative initiative to encourage domestic economic expansion with a “Peaceful” amalgamation of the worldwide economy, called the “Silk Road Economic Belt”. BRI infrastructure projects worth approximately US\$4tn (Djankov 2016) up to US\$8tn (Hurley, Morris, and Portelance 2019). The Belt and Road Initiative is deemed a concrete foreign policy and infrastructural investment of China (Huang 2016). However, the Chinese government is promoting it as an immersive narrative, rooted in the historical context of the ancient Silk Road spanning across Europe, Asia, and China (Vergeron 2018).

The international community's stance on BRI is quite mixed. Several countries encourage Chinese efforts for regional cooperation (BRI), although some nations are also worried about the possible negative implications (Starr 2019; Huang 2016). Nevertheless, some researchers denounced BRI projects as “new colonialism” (Hornby 2018) “debt-trap diplomacy” (Chellaney 2017), and “economic dependency” (Fulton 2016) as it will allow China to gain geopolitical goals by economically binding BRI participating countries (Cai 2017). Even the United States' concerns are ambivalent; it deliberates that this initiative directly influences Washington's interests and leading position in Eurasia (Tung, 2018). The Institute of China-American Studies (United States-based Think Tanks) raises numerous concerns regarding the actual motives of the “Belt and Road”, and whether this project sustains the standards that it acknowledges in the global economic competition or not.

Meanwhile, will China act as neutral and transparent while bidding for infrastructure projects and see itself as an incomparable nation after getting stouter economically and militarily from above the rules that apply to the smaller countries? (Chance, 2017). However, US Secretary of State Mike Pompeo is also cautious about “Belt and Road” as a non-economic offer in which infrastructure and connectivity projects are a security threat to the United States and its allies. He also included that it has an

element of national security, and we are working diligently to make sure everyone in the world understands that threat (IANS, 2019). It is crucial to analyze the media coverage of the BRI from the US media's perspective of how the US constructs a global trade route led by China.

However, After the inauguration of BRI, “China image,” “Chinese soft power,” and “Belt and Road” become hot topics in communication research(Xiang 2013). Several investigations have been conducted on the media representation of the China Belt and Road Initiative(Hollihan and Zhang 2016; Li 2019; D. Wang 2019; Tung 2018; Hatem and Luqiu 2018a; L. Zhang and Wu 2017; Garcia-Herrero and Xu 2019; Liang 2019; Özsu and Binark 2019; Dagtas 2019). While recognizing the richness and diversity of academic research, we currently know little about the BRI media representation in The United States media. Nevertheless, as per our knowledge, very few studies were conducted on the media representation of BRI in the US media(Starr 2019; L. Zhang and Wu 2017; Jan, Mehmood, and Hussain 2018). This research project explores The United States media narratives drawn from the two elite media outlets, “The New York Times,” and “Associated Press,” focusing on the news coverage of One Belt, One Road from March 23, 2015, to August 31, 2019. Exactly what are the images The United States has been trying to project and how it perceives the initiative? This present study examined these questions and designed a better understanding of how the United States media outlets distinguish and address BRI.

Literature Review

China has become the 2nd largest economy by benefiting from the globalization introduced by Europe and the United States. The globalization process has inevitably knotted China with other countries, environments, institutions, cultures, and systems. The newly announced project, "Belt & Road Initiative" captured the world's attention (Hollihan and Zhang 2016). Various research has been conducted on China's future and its representation in the mainstream media. Zhang (2016) researched European-China economic relations and discovered that the coverage tends to be positive towards China. However, some newspaper discourses presented China as a competitor, economic threat, and unhealthy environment for E.U. corporations to do business. Overall, newspapers gave significant attention to China's rise and soft power. After the launch of the One Belt, One Road Initiative," major media outlets of

Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets

Western countries became highly concerned with the Chinese economy, culture, society, geopolitics, Chinese image, and soft power. It has also attracted scholars' attention, mainly focusing on the cultural, philosophical, and international cooperation that has been made by China (Xiao, Li, and Hu 2019). In the meantime, researchers worldwide focus on geopolitics, the economic collaboration between Eurasia, economic situation, infrastructure development, geopolitical strategy, financial clout, and manufacturing related to BRI (Blanchard and Flint 2017; Minghao 2016; Xiao, Li, and Hu 2019). The fast-growing power of China is the most crucial reality of today's world.

The global understanding and reception of the Belt and Road initiative vary. As research illustrates, some countries see it as worth in worldwide trade connections. Some countries have concerns about China's OBOR plan." Western media attention concerning the Belt and Road initiative is negative (Devonshire 2020). However, the launch of the "Belt and Road Initiative" also attracted the mass communication scholar's attention. Several empirical researches have been conducted on the image construction, representation, framing, discourse analysis, etc. on BRI (Zhang 2017; Li 2019; D. Wang 2019; Tung 2018; Hatf and Luqiu 2018b; L. Zhang and Wu 2017; Garcia-Herrero and Xu 2019). Previous studies mentioned that many countries had expressed enthusiasm, while some countries expressed concerns over it. D. Wang (2019) investigated Indian public opinion and corpus analysis regarding BRI. Indian general public opinion has been found negative. This initiative caused worry and fear among the Indian media. As Indian Express (newspaper) points out, countries like India, The United States, Australia, and Japan will fight against Belt and Road Initiative (D. Wang 2019). In another empirical study, Tung (2018) compared the Voice of Vietnam (VOV) and China Radio International (CRI) news stories. This study found that Vietnamese media tend to focus on Vietnam's sovereignty, territorial dispute, and territorial waters disputes the New Silk Road is the move of violating the sovereignty and international laws. Besides, VOV republishes the adverse reports by the global media and raises questions about this initiative. Simultaneously, the CRI Vietnamese version tends to avoid controversial topics and publish positive cooperation opportunities linked with the BRI (Tung, 2018). In comparing Chinese

media and Afghanistan media, Hatef and Luqiu (2018) conducted three newspapers' content analysis. This study concluded that Chinese media is constructing the Chinese government's positive image as a hope for future and global leaders and strengthening the Chinese public confidence as a leading regional role. In contrast, Afghanistan's media tend to focus on bilateral plans, the country's economy, security, culture, economics, politics, and religion, and their media-constructed One Belt One Road image positively. Meanwhile, Afghanistan is a participant in the One Belt, One Road, and Geopolitically vital country to China, especially in the stability of Xinjiang and controlling illegal immigration, border arms, and drug trafficking. Nevertheless, Chinese media tend to focus on the peace talk process and rarely give coverage to domestic security issues.

China and the United States were the prime rivals after the Cold War and are considered great economic competitors. Xiao and his fellows conducted critical discourse analysis (CDA) to analyze the Belt and Road image construction in the mainstream Chinese and United States media. They found that both media play great attention in the global economy. Chinese media focus on the concrete measure for the Belt & Road by using positive vocabulary to appraise. In contrast, the United States media use explicit negative lexis to concerns of the Trump administration, even throughout the U.S. media-constructed image of BRI as the political influence agent. Though negative comments still exist, the decisive voice has increased (Xiao, Li, and Hu 2019) even though the Western media attention concerning the Belt and Road initiative is negative (Devonshire 2020)

Despite objections from the USA, the United Kingdom also chose to join "One Road, One Belt." Zhang and Wu (2017) conducted Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) with corpus-assisted analysis methods to analyze the Financial Times and China Daily. This study found that the British newspaper Financial Times has a mixed and confusing discourse that China is an authoritarian state but has a far-reaching influence on the worldwide economy. Some discourses portrayed China as the obstructive force having the geopolitical risk prevail. At the same time, Chinese media portray positive attributes by constructing positive images as a peace-loving country.

Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets

Furthermore, Herrero and Xu (2019) conducted a big data analysis of the 130 countries' Perceptions of China's B.R.I, with the help of GDELT (DataBase). This study found that the BRI has a positive image among the members and non-member countries. However, there are noticeable variances at the national level, with some countries in all regions having very negative views regarding the Belt and Road Initiative (Figure 1).

(Insert Figure 1: Sentiment across 130 countries about the Belt and Road initiative (Herrero & Xu, 2019))

Till 2019 more than 100 countries around the Globe agreed with the One Belt, One Road Initiative, and even United States strategic partners because of the rising China soft power. Parag Khanna author of the book "The Future is Asian," argues that this world is multipolar now. No one wants to choose sides instead of taking benefits from both powers to derive maximum benefits. The Cold War paradigm has no relevance anymore (Schuman 2019).

The purpose of this research is to explore how U.S. media projects the image of the Belt and Road initiative in its reporting. Manheim & Albritton (1983) characterized two main dimensions of the national image -Valence and visibility. Valance refers to available information represented in favorable or unfavorable, and visibility represents the amount of media coverage. Favorable items covered such points as growth, advancements, wealth, properties, strengths, sustainability, security, or reliability, while negative references covered deterioration, weakness, suffering, liabilities, lack of progress, uncertainty, and unreliability. Belt and Road image refers to the events projected by the U.S. newspapers in reporting the initiative. The image constructs can comprise a collection of positive and negative attributes by examining the news stories' realization and attitudinal meaning. The research questions are as under:

1. How do "The New York Times," and "Associated Press, respectively report the Belt and Road Initiative?

2. What are the different images of China's "Belt and Road Initiative" being projected in "The New York Times," and "Associated Press in the process of news reporting?

This study adopted the integrated approach by combining Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) with the corpus linguistics (CL) to investigate stated above questions. The corpus linguistics approach allows us to identify and examine the discourse function, and collocational, and semantic patterns by analyzing lexical frequency and keywords in the massive language data (Song et al., 2019). Fairclough proposed the theory of critical discourse analysis and classified a three-dimensional model i-e text (text analysis), discursive practice (contextual analysis), and social practice (interpretative analysis). It mostly identifies relationships among ideology, society, societal issues, and social problems (Fairclough 2014; 2013; 2003). Furthermore, CDA is always used for the dynamic analysis of restricted content qualitatively. Its weak interpretation ability is criticized for the subjective selection of corpus.

However, corpus linguistics has made an innovative change in categorizing frequencies, concordances, and collocations of the massive language data amount. The corpus-based critical discourse analysis methods have expanded eminence in recent years as a useful tool for discourse analysis among different social dimensions (G. Wang 2018; Feng 2017). Baker et al. (2008) first used critical discourse analysis with the corpus framework. He argues that this method is a balanced approach to quantitative corpus linguistic technique with detailed qualitative Discourse analysis.

Methodology

(Insert Table 1 Basic Corpus Data)

Data for this research were collected by the online database "Lexis Advance" of selected media outlets The New York Times, and The Associated Press (AP), by limiting six key words "BRI," "One Belt, One Road," "OBOR," "New Silk Road," "New Silk Road Initiative," and "Belt Road Initiative." These two media groups were selected because they claim that they are professional with liberal ideology in media reporting. However, the quality of newspapers, media agency circulation, the newspapers' achievement, and accessibility were measured while selecting the newspapers in this research. However, The New York Times is an internationally

Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets

recognized US mainstream newspaper, founded in New York City in 1851. It received 122 Pulitzer Prizes, and its website ranked 59th by the number of unique visitors in March 2009. The paper is notable for its success among the United States and the world elite. However, the Associated Press operates 263 bureaus in 106 countries, and its news stories are published and republished by more than 1300 media outlets (AP 2016). This study extracted news articles relevant to key terms from March 28, 2015, to August 30, 2019. March 28, 2015, was selected because the One Belt, One Road, was finalized as an official government project on this date (Yidaiyilu.com 2019). In this period, The New York Times published a maximum number of news stories as compared to other selected media outlets (See Figure 2).

(insert Figure 2: Year Wise distribution of News Stories)

In this study, two large specialized corpora were built: The New York Times (NYT), and The Associated Press (AP). After the duplication was removed, the result shows that approximately 0.8 million words in 610 articles: NYT (354 news articles; 0.47 million words), and AP (72 news articles; 0.17 million words) (see table 1). The present study utilized the corpus-assisted-discourse method to analyze the frequency of the listed words, Concordance, and collocate to examine the discursive patterns. In this analysis, the 20 top common keywords were obtained from the created two corpora. These words frequently only express grammatical meanings and have no other practical meaning. Keywords are statistically significant in a corpus. In Generating keywords in this study, each corpus was compared to "The British National Corpus (BNC) by using AntConc corpus software. The first 100 keywords were subsequently grouped into semantic categories to capture main themes; this procedure has also been adopted in previous research on media representations (Baker et al. 2008; Baker, Gabrielatos, and McEnery 2013). Concordance and collocate examinations were also conducted.

(Insert Table 2: The 20 Most Frequent Words of Selected Media Outlets)

Analysis & Discussion

This research's primary objective was to analyze image construction in the two United States media outlets regarding "The Belt and Road Initiative." Figure 2 shows the Six

search phrases' frequencies in selected media outlets diachronically between 2015 to 2019. These six search phrases "BRI," "One Belt, One Road," "OBOR," "New Silk Road," "New Silk Road Initiative," and "Belt Road Initiative" occur 986 times in total. Overall, NYT has a higher level of frequency as compared to AP. The number of occurrences of search phrases changed throughout the selected period. After the initiative's launch, the number of news occurrences was too low, but incredibly it soared from 76 to 330 in 2017. This phenomenon might be because of the proactive soft power strategy towards China's rise. Meanwhile, the United States sees China as a threat to its global hegemony and its interests (XIA 2005).

High-Frequency Word Analysis

Word frequency statistics are used to examine the discourse's semantical representation. In this research, high-frequency terms have been discussed in selected newspaper data. Although the high frequency has no practical meaning as they express grammatical meanings. We used the "AntConc" stop list feature to exclude function words. The first 20 keywords were retrieved from the two corpora, as shown in Table 1.

Most of the top 20 notional high-frequency words highlight the Belt and Road initiative's news reports' constant themes. "China" appeared as the keyword employed most frequently in the corpus, as well as keywords picturizing the salience of One Belt and Road like "trade," "economic," "projects," "initiative," "industry," and "companies." The fascinating factor in the NYT and AP corpus is that the personalities XI and Trump are also among the most frequent word lists. Words like "belt", "initiative", "projects", "Pakistan", "billion", "Asia", and "foreign", were unique in the associated press reporting data. In contrast, words including "The United States", "American", "companies", and "power" only appeared in The New York Times. The high-frequency words in both media outlets' reporting were closely associated with international relationships, which could be the possible changes this initiative brings to global politics.

Top 5 discrete Topoi.

The top 100 keywords were subsequently grouped into different semantic categories (following (Jaworska and Themistocleous 2018; Theng Ong and McKenzie 2019). Fine-grained analyses were then carried out to determine their precise meanings. This

Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets

review ensured that every keyword was categorized into its appropriate category. The top keywords in NYTC and APC were classified into five discrete topoi (see Table 3).

(Insert Table 3 Top 5 discrete Topoi for One Road & Belt Initiative)

As shown in Table 3, the most frequent top keywords of the three corpora are arranged into Semantic categories: (1) Personalities; (2) Development; (3) Commerce/Economic; (4) Politics/Warfare/ Defence/Army; (5) Geographic/Proper Names. The most notable semantic categories in the AP corpus and NYT corpus are Commerce/Economics and Politics/Warfare/ Defence/Army, which revolves around the "Belt and Road" and China soft power implications. The number of keywords is associated with warfare, political dominations, and concerns (like security, influence, sea, concerns, ties, military, claims, political, power, government, influence, and critics). This suggests the AP and NYT were primarily concerned and focused on the economic, trade & political expansion of the "Belt and Road." A closer reading of the usage contexts of keywords indicates that BRI was discussed in terms of unwanted loans, debt traps, controlling underdeveloped countries, influencing the political process, security threats, and economic, military, and geostrategic issues.

Keywords from the semantic category "Geographic," the listed countries included Pakistan, Japan, India Russia, etc. India and Japan are considered staunch opponents of the BRI because both countries' political leaders think this initiative will expand China's global influence. Chinese Military presence is a threat to the national interests; even the Indian government considers CPEC (China-Pakistan Economic Corridor) China's colonization plan for Pakistan. A closer reading of the context of keywords Malaysia indicates that the Associated Press often used it as the model for the world that the Malaysian government canceled the rail project deal immensely overcharging and criticized for the overpriced and superfluous projects. Furthermore, The New York Times and Associated Press emphasize The United States' concerns and its allies regarding Belt and Road.

Concordance lines of "Belt and Road."

In the corpus discourse analysis, Concordance is "a collection of the occurrences of a word form, each in its textual environment" (Sinclair 1991). The number of instances of "One Belt, One Road," were collected (See table 4). Therefore, in examining the key terms "Belt & Road Initiative" concordance, The New York Times has higher visibility instances 324 compared to Business Wire and Associated Press corpora. One Belt and One Road keyword incidences frequently in these three corpora. However, these Concordances indicate the media outlet reporting policy on this initiative. After this, we examine the Topmost co-occurring adjectives, verbs, and nouns with the "New Silk Road," "OBOR," and "One Belt, One Road" keywords with the assistance of two words collected. We analyzed the cataloging and found differences in the Road and Belt Initiative's representation, with varying degrees of frequency. The several common adjectives related to copra are "sweeping," "ambitious," mammoth," "enormous," and "massive". Collective nouns are "signifies," "projects," "infrastructure," "seeks," "agreements," "hits," "colonialism," "burden," and verbs are "dubbed," "suffering," "praised". The top keywords of the AP corpus related to the Belt & Road Initiative were trade, plan, infrastructure, ancient, projects, policy, sweeping, desert, associated, and reassert. However, The New York Times gave more coverage to the Belt and Road initiative about 375 collects were related to the OBOR, and Silk Road, some of the top keywords were "Multitrillion," "terminus," "memorandums," "ultimate," "internationalization," "massive" and forth on. In simple, the propaganda tone is remarkably different but has been maintained. The New York Times reported that the expansion of the project predatory had dented China's reputation globally, while others criticized the overwhelming numbers of Chinese workers imported for construction.

(Insert Table 4 Number of instances related to Belt and Road).

China & "Belt and Road Initiative in selected Newspapers

China's momentous financial development and greater openness to the world afforded it an extraordinary global status in world politics. On the other hand, the Chinese government has always been targeted and criticized in various aspects like human rights, censorship, media freedom, and freedom of speech and forth on (He 2010). A part of this China is still growing with ambition. In 2013, President Xi Jinping announced an initiative to build a world of shared prosperity through win-win

Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets

cooperation named 21st Century Maritime Silk Road. China has pledged trillions of dollars for global infrastructure projects with many opportunities worldwide for the sphere to seek joint development from roads, railways, and power plants to ports. Trump administration has several concerns about the Belt and Road Initiative; they criticize it as a trap for the geopolitical purpose of increasing Beijing's economic and diplomatic clout. Also, it designated China as an existential threat, revisionist power & strategic competitor (Barkin 2019). Furthermore, the Trump administration *accused* China of predatory lending for a debt trap, acquiring strategic assets, and spreading corruption & authoritarian values (Wong 2019). China is forming different institutions to reshape prevailing economic norms to suit its own needs. Trump accused China of unfair trading practices. Meanwhile, China believes that the United States does not want to see its rise as a global economic hub. It has been two years; a trade dispute simmered between the United States and China. Both economic powers are imposing tariffs on one another goods (BBC 2019).

In the NYT corpus, the initiative was treated in a wide range of contexts like "dauntingly complicated", "scandalous mired", "debt trap", "unfathomable in nature", "aggressive expansion", "project predatory", and "military threat". New York Times reporting was related to China's economic plan that it is investing hundreds and billions of dollars in infrastructure projects in more than 60 countries. This investment leads to the corrosion of nations' sovereignty (Glaser 2018). Besides, China is cultivating influence throughout Eurasian countries via aggressive expansion, while some countries complained about unsustainable loans and debts (Perlez 2019). The New York Times associated "Belt and Road" with the debt trap that is pouring money (low-cost loans) to expand visionary economic plans by financing infrastructure and other projects worldwide. Expanding its political influence in underdeveloped countries and making it beholden by China (AnaSwanson 2019).

Meanwhile, NYT also put forward another concern that China's initiative could become the "new *colonialism*" by taking control of natural resources like oil, iron, and even food from "*vulnerable countries*" that had trouble paying back the long-term loans (Bradsher 2018). Soaring long-term debts in the form of investment is a new form of colonialism (Goodman 2019) and these billions of dollars are debts for spates

of unnecessary projects (Kauffmann 2019). Malaysia canceled the rail project, slammed for vastly overcharging under the Initiative (Myers 2019). Some projects have been dogged by corruption accusations, shady construction, and poor decision-making (Barry 2018). NYT also portrayed BRI as a Chinese Ambivalent activity, Which has many faces that Some projects might be boondoggles. Some could have economic benefits, some might be effective in reducing poverty, and some might fulfill the corporate interest of the China government(Millward 2018).

China is using so-called *debt diplomacy* to expand Beijing's political and military influence around the Globe. NYT constructed Sri Lanka as the warning model for other countries that agreed with the Belt and Road program and took a massive debt from the Chinese state-owned companies for building a port and had to hand over a port after it fell behind Chinese loans (Stevenson 2019). *Mr. Pence (a United States politician)* argued that It might soon become a forward military base for China's growing blue-water navy(Abi-Habib 2018). Like Sri Lanka, Venezuela had trouble paying back the loan to its creditors (Russia and China). The Moscow government bargained on the overdue debts and won the right for warships to visit ports (Bradsher and Londoño 2018). Taking over the defaulter countries' assets is because China wants to expand and exercise its passive power (Thrush 2018).

Retrospectively, China's initiative's growth brought significant attention worldwide. It brings a dramatic change in the relationship and cooperation between the world. The European community is negotiating possible trade and bilateral cooperation trade under the platform of Belt and Road. Several European nations are United States allies. Italy is one of the most reliable United States allies, and members of the Group of 7 nations became part of the Belt & Road initiative. NYT reported For decades, Italy dominated the global economy and felt the brunt of the Chinese economic juggernaut that the United States argues poses a threat to the financial and political future of the West" (Horowitz 2019; Kauffmann 2019). Moreover, NYT frames Europe as the prey in the great power game among the three nations; its political allegiance with China and its internal division are weakening the West (Horowitz 2019). Unsurprisingly, The New York Times shades more coverage to Belt and Road as the debt trap", "military threat," "one-way road," "so-called Belt and Road," "new colonizers," "aggressive project," "political influence," "new geopolitics strategy," "geopolitical threat "and "strategic threat" as compare to other media outlets.

Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets

However, the Associated Press" corpus and initiative was treated in a wide range of contexts like "trade", "plan", "infrastructure", "ancient", "projects", "policy", "sweeping", "desert", "associated", reassert and forth on. In 2016, Political issues weighed in the G-20 summit in China themed *"Toward an Innovative, Invigorated, Interconnected and Inclusive World Economy,"* Associated Press constructed this summit as a non-conformational and uneventful summit, where despite controversial issues china seems to deliver in the summit. *Meanwhile, China is trying to deepen its trade relations with the neighboring countries by supporting them financially from AIIB to open new trade and new markets. Leaders in the world's No. 2 economy have long felt they do not have proportional influence inside international financial institutions dominated by Western powers* (Franchineau 2016). Even though this initiative is natural to China Washington, Moscow, and Dehli were worrying about this initiative that it might build political influence, which might undermine human rights, environmental, and freedom standards(Mcdonald 2017).

Conclusion

This study applied the CDA method to explore the image representation of the Belt and Road initiative based on the New York Times and associated press corps. Data was drawn from the Lexis advance. The media outlet's data contains editorials, opinions, and news articles by various authors. This study endeavors to investigate the Belt and Road Initiative's diverse perspective conveyed through US media outlets. China and the United States relationships have fluctuated from coming close to open conflict after both countries imposed tariffs on imports and exports. Meanwhile, the United States also has concerns regarding the Belt and Road initiative. Within this paper's framework, how do selected media outlets report the BRI and the different images of China's "BRI" being projected in reporting?

The major finding of this research shows that both selected media outlets have acknowledged BRI for bringing world opportunities by investing billions of dollars in many countries. The New York Times and Associated Press focus on the initiative's specific measures, and its political and economic influence on the world. The selected media outlets use explicit negative vocabulary to reflect the US government's doubts and concerns about the initiative. The number of keywords associated with warfare,

political dominations, concerns, security, influence, sea, ties, military, claims, power, government, influence, critics, etc. These concerns might be because of media outlet ownership, ideology, and commercial imperatives (Shoemaker and Vos 2009). However, We also observe that in some stories NYT portrayed “One Belt One Road” as the new way of colonizing the world, especially emerging countries by investing too much in superfluous development projects. Also represented the BRI Marshall Plan as a new military threat, regional threat, and new imperialist communist state.

In contrast, the Associated Press portrays a new Silk Road in passive terms like giving more vitality to the debt concerns, bribing to get the different infrastructure projects, and aggressive, new obstructive force. However, findings are in line with those (Chellaney 2017; Fulton 2016; Cai 2017; Tung 2018). According to Manheim & Albritton (1983) characterized two main dimensions of the national image, this study concluded that the Belt and Road image attributes were presented negatively.

In this research, the adaptation of the keyword analysis helped to identify linguistic patterns represented in media outlets about BRI. Furthermore, the CDA-based concept of *topoi* offers further insights into BRI presentation in US media outlets. Meanwhile, it was quite troublesome to group the keywords into categories. So, prospective studies should refine categorization methods to prevent unnecessarily biased classifications. Therefore, in the two self-built corpora, the number of terms found is different in volume. Based on the exploratory research features of this report, it is proposed that, at a later point, the related research could extend the span of diachronic research, broaden the reach of the corpus, and use various scientific analysis techniques to develop such research continually. This paper has undertaken only a small phase in understanding Chinese Belt and Road image construction in US media outlets. There is a great deal more to be done. Future research may gather broader data samples and analyze how other nations, such as China's neighboring countries, might Countries and regions in their media, perceive and portray the Belt and the Road. Besides discovering more concrete facts of image representation and projection, and learning how image creation interacts with other influences, ethnographic analysis with interviews and case studies should be promoted.

Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets

References

- Abi-Habib, Maria. 2018. "China's 'Belt and Road' Plan in Pakistan Takes a Military Turn." *The New York Times*, 2018.
- AnaSwanson. 2019. "Trade Standoff Is Initial Volley In China Battle." *The New York Times*, 2019.
- AP. 2016. "A Look at the Year through AP Stats and Figures." 2016. <https://www.ap.org/about/annual-report/2016/ap-by-the-numbers.html>.
- Baker, Paul, Costas Gabrielatos, Majid Khosravini, Michał Krzyżanowski, Tony McEnery, and Ruth Wodak. 2008. "A Useful Methodological Synergy? Combining Critical Discourse Analysis and Corpus Linguistics to Examine Discourses of Refugees and Asylum Seekers in the UK Press." *Discourse & Society* 19 (3): 273–306.
- Baker, Paul, Costas Gabrielatos, and Tony McEnery. 2013. *Discourse Analysis and Media Attitudes*. Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511920103>.
- Barkin, Noah. 2019. "The U.S. Is Losing Europe in Its Battle With China." *The Atlantic*, 2019. <https://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2019/06/united-states-needs-europe-against-china/590887/>.
- Barry, Jaime Yaya. 2018. "One African Nation Put the Brakes on Chinese Debt. But Not for Long." *The New York Times*, 2018.
- BBC. 2019. "A Quick Guide to the US-China Trade War." *bbc.com*. 2019. <https://www.bbc.com/news/business-45899310>.
- Blanchard, Jean-Marc F, and Colin Flint. 2017. "The Geopolitics of China's Maritime Silk Road Initiative." *Geopolitics*.
- Bradsher, Keith. 2018. "China Taps the Brakes on Its Global Push for Influence." *The New York Times*, 2018.

- Bradsher, Keith, and E Londoño. 2018. “At Davos, It’s China That’s the Belle of the Ball.” *The New York Times*, 2018.
- Cai, Peter. 2017. “Understanding China’s Belt and Road Initiative.” *Lowy Institute*.
[https://www.lowyinstitute.org/sites/default/files/documents/Understanding China’s Belt and Road Initiative_WEB_1.pdf](https://www.lowyinstitute.org/sites/default/files/documents/Understanding%20China's%20Belt%20and%20Road%20Initiative_WEB_1.pdf).
- Chellaney, Brahma. 2017. “China’s Debt-Trap Diplomacy.” Chellaney. 2017.
<https://chellaney.net/2017/01/25/chinas-debt-trap-diplomacy/>.
- Dagtas, Banu. 2019. “At the Crossroads of the New Silk Road: News Discourses in the Turkish Press.” *Communication and the Public* 4 (4): 276–90.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/2057047319896214>.
- Devonshire, Chris. 2020. “A Comparison Between Countries & Territories Not In China’s Belt And Road Initiative With Those Who Are.” 2020.
<https://www.silkroadbriefing.com/news/2019/10/18/comparison-countries-territories-not-chinas-belt-road-initiative/>.
- Djankov, Simeon. 2016. “The Rationale Behind China’s Belt And Road Initiative.” In, 59:407–28. Peterson Institute for International Economics.
<https://doi.org/10.1525/as.2019.59.3.407>.
- Fairclough, Norman. 2003. *Analysing Discourse: Textual Analysis for Social Research*. Psychology Press.
- Feng, William Dezheng. 2017. “Ideological Dissonances among Chinese-Language Newspapers in Hong Kong: A Corpus-Based Analysis of Reports on the Occupy Central Movement.” *Discourse & Communication* 11 (6): 549–66.
- Franchineau, Helene. 2016. “China-Led Development Bank Aims to Swiftly Approve Loans.” *The Associated Press*, 2016.
- Fulton, Jonathan. 2016. “An Analysis of Two Corridors in China’s One Belt One Road Initiative: China-Pakistan and China Central-West Asia.” *Inter-Regional Connectivity*.
- Garcia-Herrero, Alicia, and Jianwei Xu. 2019. “Countries’ Perceptions of China’s Belt and Road Initiative: A Big Data Analysis.” *SSRN Electronic Journal*, 20.
<https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3430318>.

Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets

- Glaser, Bonnie s. 2018. "The U.S. Needs Its Friends." *The New York Times*, 2018.
- Goodman, Peter S. 2019. "Staying Mighty, Dollar Fortifies Trump's Power." *The New York Times*, 2019.
- Hatef, Azeta, and Luwei Rose Luqiu. 2018a. "Where Does Afghanistan Fit in China's Grand Project? A Content Analysis of Afghan and Chinese News Coverage of the One Belt, One Road Initiative." *International Communication Gazette* 80 (6): 551–69.
- . 2018b. "Where Does Afghanistan Fit in China's Grand Project? A Content Analysis of Afghan and Chinese News Coverage of the One Belt, One Road Initiative." *International Communication Gazette* 80 (6): 551–69. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1748048517747495>.
- He, Miao. 2010. "An Analysis of Framing in British News Media Representations of China and the Chinese." Loughborough University: Loughborough University. <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/2.5/>.
- Hollihan, Thomas A., and Zhan Zhang. 2016. "Media Narratives of China's Future." *Global Media and China*, no. 03. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2059436416654382>.
- Hornby, Lucy. 2018. "Mahathir Mohamad Warns against 'New Colonialism' during China Visit." *The Financial Times*, 2018. <https://www.ft.com/content/7566599e-a443-11e8-8ecf-a7ae1beff35b>.
- Horowitz, Jason. 2019. "Italy's Silk Road Deal With China Signals a Shift as U.S. Influence Wanes." *The New York Times*, 2019.
- Huang, Yiping. 2016. "Understanding China's Belt & Road Initiative: Motivation, Framework and Assessment." *China Economic Review* 40 (2016): 314–21. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chieco.2016.07.007>.
- Hurley, John, Scott Morris, and Gailyn Portelance. 2019. "Examining the Debt Implications of the Belt and Road Initiative from a Policy Perspective." *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development* 3 (1): 139. <https://doi.org/10.24294/jipd.v3i1.1123>.

- Jan, Inamullah, Tariq Mehmood, and Shabir Hussain. 2018. "American, Indian and Chinese Media on 'Belt and Road Initiative.'" *Global Social Sciences Review III (IV)*: 31–48. [https://doi.org/10.31703/gssr.2018\(iii-iv\).03](https://doi.org/10.31703/gssr.2018(iii-iv).03).
- Jaworska, Sylvia, and Christiana Themistocleous. 2018. "Public Discourses on Multilingualism in the UK: Triangulating a Corpus Study with a Sociolinguistic Attitude Survey." *Language in Society* 47 (1): 57–88.
- Kauffmann, Sylvie. 2019. "Europe Is a Soft Target. And It's Under Attack." *The New York Times*, 2019.
- Li, Zhou. 2019. "American Political Discourse on China." *Critical Studies in Media Communication*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315442600>.
- Liang, Fan. 2019. "The New Silk Road on Facebook: How China's Official Media Cover and Frame a National Initiative for Global Audiences." *Communication and the Public* 4 (4): 261–75. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2057047319894654>.
- Manheim, Jarol B., and Robert B. Albritton. 1983. "Changing National Images: International Public Relations and Media Agenda Setting." *American Political Science Review* 78 (3): 641–57. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1961834>.
- Mcdonald, Joe. 2017. "'Silk Road' Plan Stirs Unease over China's Strategic Goals." *The Associated Press*, 2017.
- Millward, James A. 2018. "Is China a Colonial Power?" *The New York Times*, 2018.
- Minghao, Zhao. 2016. "The Belt and Road Initiative and Its Implications for China-Europe Relations." *The International Spectator* 51 (4): 109–18.
- Myers, Steven Lee. 2019. "Xi Faces Threat As Hong Kong Defies Beijing." *The New York Times*, 2019.
- Özsu, Gökçe, and Ferruh Mutlu Binark. 2019. "Representation of the 'Belt and Road Initiative' in Turkish Mainstream Newspapers." *Communication and the Public* 4 (4): 291–304. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2057047319895448>.
- Perlez, Jane. 2019. "China Retools Vast Global Building Push Criticized as Bloated and Predatory." *The New York Times*, 2019. <https://www.nytimes.com/2019/04/25/business/china-belt-and-road->

Representation of Belt and Road Initiative in US Media Outlets

infrastructure.html.

- Schuman, Michael. 2019. "The U.S. Can't Make Allies Take Sides Over China." *The Atlantic*, 2019. <https://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2019/04/us-allies-washington-china-belt-road/587902/>.
- Shoemaker, Pamela J, and Timothy Vos. 2009. *Gatekeeping Theory*. Routledge.
- Sinclair, John. 1991. *Corpus, Concordance, Collocation*. Oxford University Press.
- Song, Yunya, Chin-Chuan Lee, and Zeping Huang. 2019. "The News Prism of Nationalism versus Globalism: How Does the US, UK, and Chinese Elite Press Cover 'China's Rise'?" *Journalism*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1464884919847143>.
- Starr, S Frederick. 2019. "US Perspectives on China's Belt and Road Initiative in Central Asia and the South Caucasus." *International Studies*, 0020881719851916.
- Stevenson, Alexandra. 2019. "China Yields On Rail Plan In Malaysia." *The New York Times*, 2019.
- Theng Ong, Theng, and Robert M McKenzie. 2019. "The Language of Suffering: Media Discourse and Public Attitudes towards the MH17 Air Tragedy in Malaysia and the UK." *Discourse & Communication*, 1750481319842455.
- Thrush, Glenn. 2018. "China's Weight Fuels Reversal By Trump On Foreign Aid." *The New York Times*, 2018.
- Tung, Tran Son. 2018. "The Communication and Interpretation of the One Belt and One Road by Chinese and Vietnamese Media in the Perspective of Frame Analysis Case Study of China Radio International CRI and Voice of Vietnam VOV in Comparison." *Global Media Journal* 16 (30): 1–8.
- Vergeron, Karine Lisbonne de. 2018. "The New Silk Roads: European Perceptions and Perspectives." *International Studies* 55 (4): 339–49. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0020881718812308>.
- Wang, Dan. 2019. "A Corpus-Based Analysis of Public Opinion to the Belt and Road

- Initiative Represented by the Indian Leading English Newspapers.” *9th International Conference on Education and Social Science (ICESS 2019)*. Francis Academic Press, UK. <https://doi.org/10.25236/icess.2019.192>.
- Wang, Guofeng. 2018. “A Corpus-Assisted Critical Discourse Analysis of News Reporting on China’s Air Pollution in the Official Chinese English-Language Press.” *Discourse & Communication* 12 (6): 645–62.
- XIA, MING. 2005. “‘China Threat’ or a ‘Peaceful Rise of China’? .” *The New York Times*. 2005. <https://archive.nytimes.com/www.nytimes.com/ref/college/coll-china-politics-007.html>.
- Xiang, Debao. 2013. “China’s Image on International English Language Social Media.” *Journal of International Communication* 19 (2): 252–71.
- Xiao, Ya, Yue Li, and Jie Hu. 2019. “Construction of the Belt and Road Initiative in Chinese and American Media: A Critical Discourse Analysis Based on Self-Built Corpora.” *International Journal of English Linguistics* 9 (3): 68–77.
- Yidaiyilu.com. 2019. “The Belt and Road Initiative Progress Contributions and Prospects.” Yidaiyilu.Com. 2019. <https://eng.yidaiyilu.gov.cn/zchj/qwfb/86739.html>.
- Zhang. 2017. “How to Implement Green Development Concepts in One Belt One Road Construction.” *Econ. Rev.*
- Zhang, Lejin, and Doreen Wu. 2017. “Media Representations of China: A Comparison of China Daily and Financial Times in Reporting on the Belt and Road Initiative.” *Critical Arts* 31 (6): 29–43.
- Zhang, Zhan. 2016. “A Narrative Future for Europe–China Economic Relations after the Financial Crisis.” *Global Media and China* 1 (1–2): 49–69.

**Framing of Pakistan Democratic
Movement (PDM) in Pakistani English
Leading Newspapers, A Historic Regime
Change Movement**

Dr.Aqsa Iram Shahzadi

Assistant Professor, Institute of Media and
Communication Studies, Bahauddin
Zakariya University, Multan
mrsaqsaairam@bzu.edu.pk

Ayesha Nawaz

Lecturer, Govt Gordon Graduate College,
Rawalpindi.
ayesha97nawaz@gmail.com

Faisal Rehman

M.Phil Scholar, Institute of Media and
Communication Studies, Bahauddin
Zakariya University, Multan

Abstract

The research explored the frames used to explain the Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) in two mainstream English newspapers of Pakistan, The Nation and Daily Times for the sake of coding different frames used in these newspapers. For this study, the researchers analyzed 197 editorials that were related to PDM only and were published on the editorial pages of both newspapers. The census study was applied for quantitative content analysis methodology, so all the editorials related to positive or negative coverage of the Pakistan Democratic Movement were studied under this particular study. The theoretical framework linked to this research is the framing theory of media. The data was coded into the existing categories of gaming frame, strategic framing, interpretative framing, Objective framing, political balance, political imbalance, personalization, institutionalization, negative framing, and positive framing of the Pakistan Democratic Movement. The analysis reveals that The Nation used gaming frame personalization Negative framing for PDM and published more articles on editorial pages related to PDM as compared to Daily Times. Daily Times used a personalization frame and positively framed PDM. Furthermore, strategic and interpretative frames were found in moderate amounts while objective framing and political imbalance frames were not observed at all in the analysis in any newspaper, and gaming frame was less used in Daily Times as compared to the Nation. the difference in the framing techniques of both the newspapers is that the Daily Times framed the issue by being Pro PDM and The Nation framed it as Anti PDM.

Keywords: *Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM), framing theory, Pakistani Press, historic movement*

1- Introduction

With the advent of technology, the communication gap has been reduced and the political awareness and participation of masses and institutions have been revolutionized after the advent of the printing press and electronic media. The spread of information got quicker with the advent of different mediums (Paul Lazarsfeld, 1948). Pakistan is a democratic country, so it has various political parties with various manifestoes and interests (H Shehzad, 2022). The Ruling party right now is Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz which came into power

Framing of Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) in Pakistani English Leading Newspapers

after the dismissal of X Prime Minister Imran Khan by running a country-wide movement named as Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) formally came into the limelight in September 2020.

The agenda of this movement was to demolish the government of Pakistan Tehreek e Insaaf (PTI). They also have a slogan which in Urdu is “Vote ko izzat do” and in English is to honor and respect the vote of the public of Pakistan (F Batool, 2021).

It is a coalition of opposite parties against a sitting government. The issue stated in All Party Conference (APC) is that Imran Khan didn't come into power through a fair and just election but by the selection of a military establishment. Framing studies are always important as they exhibit the hidden policy of the newspaper slanting or angling process (Oxford Analytica, 2020). The newspapers chosen for the research are The Nation and Daily Times as these are two leading newspapers of Pakistan by circulation. The Pakistan Democratic Movement was launched on 20th September 2020 so the best representation of the movement in both the English dailies is after September 2020. So the researcher chose the coverage of three months after the movement started, which includes October 2020, November 2020, and December 2020 as the coverage of PDM was maximum during these months (M Joshi, 2022).

The public is more interested in the narration of the events as compared to the construction of the story (TM Khan, 2020). However, the construction of news is a very important factor to be examined by the researcher to assess how social contexts are reproduced in the views of the readers. The readers of the newspapers are undergoing a process of opinion building by being exposed to the framed content of the newspapers. The researcher explores how the media presented the movement in his opinion articles or editorials. The researcher found out if the newspapers supported the manifesto of all the eleven parties. Or it supported the activities of PTI; the sitting government at that time? (M Mehdi, 2022)

2- Literature Review

2.1 Framing Theory

Framing theory revolves around the methods and techniques to unfold the hidden meaning and tell the undescribed events hidden in the textual discourse or visual

data (M Cissel, 2012). Media framing is directly explained by the statement that media personnel prepare the frames for communicating certain propaganda or highlighting a certain issue through an identified process and putting it in the minds of the masses. In the current study, the frames used by The Nation and Daily Times were analyzed using the Framing Theory of how media present this issue. The framing through language consists of three key elements that are language, thought, and forethought (Fairhurst, 1996). Media extends frames through the use of words and pictures, placing the issue in prominent places in newspapers and continuously repeating the issue in every edition of the paper. Media affects the thought process of people by giving them food for thought with the help of angling the socio-political issues in a certain manner. Media affects the forethought when people act according to media (Becker, 1984).

According to Entman, the opinion of any person can be shaped, molded, or manipulated by the media (J Matthes, 2009). Many political parties run their campaigns on media to gain public attention and develop an interest in their party motto, they use particular frames like the emotional and sacrificing frame used by the Pakistan People's Party in the name of Shaheed Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and Benazir Bhutto to gain sympathy vote of the public. Framing affects when it is spontaneous and repetitive. Indian media uses a sensationalist frame whenever it has to cover Pakistan (N Abraham, 2019).

According to Noam Chomsky, media framing intentionally or unintentionally, directly or indirectly always acts upon the policy of that media organization (PJ Davies, 2022). One of the major factors is that if the media frames the sitting government as negative the government will stop giving them advertisements which is the main source of revenue for newspapers and electronic mediums. The other factor is seeking public attention if the media doesn't add suspense, negativity, sensational, or hype-creating frames then the traffic on that newspaper or TV channel drops as people want entertainment as well as information called infotainment (Neuendorf, 2018).

Western media has used the frame of communism against China and Russia for a very long period and now the frame changed to fear or War on terror (S F Pratt, 2022). War on terror is just the cover of the book western media is framing

Framing of Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) in Pakistani English Leading Newspapers

Muslims as Extremists and violent and somewhere as terrorists. People from Afghanistan, Syria, and Kashmir were slanted as terrorists in Western media while Pakistani media framed them as militants. This way the fear frame sustains in the routine of elite media the issue that creates fear in the minds of the masses changes but the fear frame sustains (Chomsky, 2002).

The major functions of media are to spread diverse opinions, report socio-political events, provide a platform for discussion and advocacy of rights, hold people accountable or watchdog role, window to the world role, and make sure the involvement of the masses in the political process (C Naoroz, 2021). But while performing all these functions the main function of gatekeeping affects the filtering and editing of the news according to the policy of the organization, external pressures, and the editor's subjectivity. this movement claimed that Imran Khan was not elected but selected as prime minister and the working bodies behind his selection were the military establishment and agencies (DD Freyenberger, 2013).

2.2 Research Questions

RQ1: What are the most important frames in The Nation in the coverage of PDM?

RQ2: What are the most important frames in the Daily Times in the coverage of PDM?

RQ3: What are the least prominent frames in The Nation in the coverage of PDM?

RQ4: What are the least prominent frames in the Daily Times in the coverage of PDM?

RQ5: Which newspaper framed PDM positively?

RQ6: What is the difference between the framing of both newspapers?

RQ7: Which newspaper gave more coverage to PDM?

RQ8: which newspaper playing up frame for PDM?

3- Methodology

The researchers have applied the best-suited method to this study. The data of this study includes the editorial analysis and slanting perspective practiced by certain media channels (Riffe, 1997) The content analysis method is applied to quantitative investigations and research that could produce reliable and generalizable results. Today framing is a frequently applied paradigm in the discipline of communication and can be accessed through content analysis (Bryant, 2004). The proper definition of content analysis was given as it is a study of messages extended on media and is quantitative in nature irrespective of the context of the phenomenon and the traits of variables (Neuendorf, 2002).

The meaning of media text exploration was initiated in the 20th century (Hansen, 1998) this

This study aims to analyze the representation of the Pakistan Democratic Movement which was a coalition of 11 leading political parties of Pakistan against a single party Pakistan Tehreek E Insaaf. The population of this research is the *Daily Times* and *The Nation*. These are the two most important and leading English dailies in terms of circulation. As it is a census study sampling is not required. The unit of analysis of this study is the articles given on the editorial pages of both newspapers. The time frame opted for this study is three months from October 1st to December 30th, 2020. This time frame is used because the movement started in September 2020 against the government of Imran Khan this movement claimed that Imran Khan was not elected but selected as prime minister and the working bodies behind his selection were the military establishment and agencies.

3.1 Operationalization of variables

Entman's (1993) coding criteria are used as the coding scheme for framing the editorial contents into their number of valence.

- Gaming frame

Framing of Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) in Pakistani English Leading Newspapers

When media gives the political coverage of Individuals, parties, or institutions as a game, a game refers to an activity in which one group has to win while the other has to lose (Albert, 2012)

- Strategic frame

This frame is a macro level frame that includes the surrounding aspects of the political activity like planning, execution, failed or flawed strategies and policies (Albert, 2012)

- Interpretive frame

It is practiced where journalists enjoy more power and freedom of speech to control the publishing of news. It is a subjective approach where the analysis of the journalist is given as it is without further filtering the news analysis (Skovsgaard, 2013).

- Objective frame

It is impartial reporting where the views of the journalists are not mixed with the data.

- Political balance

When newspapers give equal coverage to all the parties in a democratic system it is known as Political Balance (Hoppman, 2012).

- Political imbalance

When one party is given more coverage as compared to the other parties then this practice is known as political imbalance.

- Personalization

When the activities of politicians are regarded as an individual effort but not a team success or he is regarded solely for his efforts not as a party leader or member then this is known as personalization (Aelst, et. al., 2017).

- Institutionalization

This is a group work effort, when media such as newspapers comment on the group activity more rather than criticizing or appreciating a single person then this is known as institutionalization which is the opposite of personalization.

- Negativity

The news analysis mostly contains criticism of political practices, misconduct of politicians, their scandals, their failure, and their causes, the allegations from the masses are also part of the routine while politically analyzing data in newspapers (Esser, 2017)

- Positivity

When the positive side of politicians is highlighted in the media like reporting related to development and successful execution of a plan it is called positive framing of that politician or party.

- Frequency

The frequency of occurrence of a particular angle (positive or negative) of a particular story reflects the policy of the newspaper especially when it comes to newspapers and particularly its editorial page.

- Placement

The placement of an event, story, photograph, caption, advertisement, or cartoon is of supreme importance, especially in creating the priority order among the audience. The placement can be of three types, stories on top of the page are the most important issues under the masthead then lesser important issues are placed in the middle, and the least important like letters to the editor are placed at the bottom of the page.

4- Findings

Table no. 01

Framing Analysis of the Editorial Page of *The Nation*

| Framing | October | | November | | December | |
|----------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| | Placement | Frequency | Placement | Frequency | Placement | Frequency |
| Gaming Frame | Middle | 9 | Top | 7 | Top | 4 |
| Strategic | Bottom | 1 | Top | 2 | Top | 3 |
| Interpretative | Top | 2 | Middle | 4 | Middle | 2 |

Framing of Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) in Pakistani English Leading Newspapers

| | | | | | | |
|----------------------|--------|----|--------|---|--------|---|
| Objective | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | Bottom | 2 |
| Political Balance | Bottom | 2 | Middle | 2 | Bottom | 4 |
| Political Imbalance | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Personalization | Top | 9 | Top | 8 | Middle | 5 |
| Institutionalization | Middle | 3 | Bottom | 2 | Bottom | 1 |
| Negativity | Top | 12 | Top | 9 | Top | 5 |
| Positivity | Bottom | 2 | Bottom | 3 | Bottom | 2 |
| Monthly Total | 40 | | 37 | | 28 | |
| Total | 105 | | | | | |

According to the table. no.01, the gaming frame was used 9 times in editorials of October 2020 reflecting that this newspaper used the terms like Captain for Imran Khan and no ball and white ball or sixer for his activities and plans especially while reporting the content related to PDM. The next most prevalent frame used is personalization which means that this newspaper in its 9 editorials reflected the descriptions which appreciate the actions and statements of a single person rather than the whole party in terms of the political scenario, The Nation criticized Nawaz Sharif, Asif Ali Zardari, and Molana Fazl Ur Rehman separately for their corruption cases, offshore companies, fake health issues, and political fall rather than criticizing them as a whole in the articles, on the other hand, the newspaper mostly appreciated the efforts of Imran Khan alone, not the Whole Pakistan Tehreek e Insaaf for its policies. The third most prominent frame in the newspaper is Negativity, The nation criticized PDM for its policies and called it an alliance of corrupts, thieves, and people who used to be thick enemies in the past. The gaming frame remained on the top or middle of the editorial page while the personalization and negativity frame remained consistent on the top of

the editorial page in the article under the masthead. The total editorials that covered the issue of PDM during three months are 105 which is more than the articles in the Daily Times.

Table. no.2

Framing Analysis of the editorial page of *Daily Times*

| Framing | October | | November | | December | |
|----------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| | Placement | Frequency | Placement | Frequency | placement | Frequency |
| Gaming Frame | Middle | 3 | Middle | 3 | Bottom | 1 |
| Strategic | Top | 3 | Top | 4 | 0 | 0 |
| Interpretative | Bottom | 2 | Middle | 7 | Middle | 4 |
| Objective | Middle | 2 | Bottom | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| Political Balance | Bottom | 3 | Bottom | 1 | Bottom | 3 |
| Political Imbalance | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Personalization | Middle | 6 | Top | 3 | Middle | 4 |
| Institutionalization | Bottom | 4 | Middle | 2 | Bottom | 3 |
| Negativity | Bottom | 3 | Bottom | 1 | Bottom | 2 |
| Positivity | Top | 10 | Top | 7 | Top | 9 |
| Monthly Total | 36 | | 30 | | 26 | |
| Total | 92 | | | | | |

According to the table. no.02, the gaming frame was used 3 times in editorials of October 2020 reflecting that this newspaper used lesser terms like Captain for Imran Khan and no ball and white ball or sixer for him especially while reporting the content related to PDM. The next most prevalent frame used is personalization which means that this newspaper in its 9 editorials reflected the linguistic discourse that appreciates the actions and statements of a single person rather than the whole

Framing of Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) in Pakistani English Leading Newspapers

party in terms of political scenario, Daily Times criticized Imran Khan a lot of times for selecting Usman Buzdar as CM of Punjab, a very wrong and provoking move that can lead him to failure, this newspaper supported PDM's objectives of fair elections and respect of vote. on the other hand, the newspaper mostly appreciated the past efforts of Nawaz Sharif and criticized Imran Khan as a storyteller as he couldn't fulfill his promises related to the development of New Pakistan. The third most prominent frame in the newspaper is Positivity, The Daily Times strongly supported PDM for its policies and demanded of dismissal of Imran Khan selected by the military establishment. The positive framing of PDM was the most prevalent category observed from the data and all the editorials on top of the editorial page positively supported the members, policies, and statements of PDM. The second most prevalent frame was personalization mostly published on the middle page articles. The last frame that remained evident among others is gaming which was mostly published in the middle or bottom of the editorial page. The total number of articles that incorporated the matters related to PDM are 92 which is lesser than The Nation.

5- Discussion & Conclusion

A page is specified in the newspaper to publicize the editorial, editorial note, cartoon, opinion columns, and letter to editors in English newspapers. The main editorial is published under the masthead of the newspaper. The layout of this page is novel from the front page, back page, and other pages of the newspapers. The extent of the article includes 200-500 words (Van Dijk, 1992). The routine includes collection, selection, angling, copy-making, source addition and placement in the newspaper, printing, and dissemination of information (Becker, 1984). The framing process includes the mixing of objective data which is 5W and 1H and the textual elements which are words and pictures with the background context of the study like subjective views of the editor and policy of the organization (Kosicki, 1993).

This research seeks the frames that the journalists penetrated in the editorial content of the data while covering the issue of the Pakistan Democratic movement

on the editorial page of two leading English dailies, The Nation and Daily Times which are among the most circulated English newspapers of Pakistan.

RQ1: What are the most important frames in The Nation in the coverage of the Pakistan Democratic Movement?

The most important frames in The Nation are **game framing, personalization, and negativity frame**. The number of occurrences of game frame-based editorials is 9, the personalization frame is also found in 9 editorials and the Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) was framed as negative in 12 editorials. The words used that exhibited the usage of the game frame were hit the ball, sixer, no ball, and out and the words that depicted the usage of the personalization frame are Imran Khan as an all-rounder, Nawaz Sharif as a corrupt and one who faked his ailments to leave the jail and the court hearings, Bilawal Bhutto as useless Oxford grad. The words that reflected the negative framing of PDM in The Nation are an alliance of thieves, an alliance of foes with a long history of blaming each other, and claiming that Imran Khan was right when he said that Sharif was attacking the Pakistan army on the behest of Indian friend Modi and Sharif brothers reading books behind bars.

RQ2: What are the most important frames in the Daily Times in the coverage of the Pakistan Democratic Movement?

The most important frames in the Daily Times are the **personalization and positivity frames**. The number of occurrences of personalization frame is found in 6 editorials and the Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) was positively framed in 10

editorials. Daily Times also used the personalization frame to criticize the dull and incompetent nature of Buzdar the CM of PTI and quoted and criticized the statements of Imran Khan when he said I have no threat of opposition movement. The words that reflected the use of positive frames for all party alliance or PDM were a continuous repetition of the slogan of PDM “respect the vote” and their cartoons criticized the poor performance of the PTI government, a cartoon depicting Imran Khan holding a bowl and begging from IMF.

Framing of Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) in Pakistani English Leading Newspapers

RQ3: What are the least Prominent frames in The Nation in the coverage of the Pakistan Democratic Movement? The least important frame used in The Nation newspaper is

Strategic framing, political imbalance, and objective framing while the frames that were used in a moderate practice in The Nation are political balance, institutionalization, and interpretative framing.

RQ4: What are the least Prominent frames in the Daily Times in the coverage of the Pakistan Democratic Movement? The least prominent frames used in the Daily Times newspaper are the **gaming frame, political imbalance, and objective reporting** while the frames used in a moderate practice in the Daily Times are interpretative, political balance, and institutionalization frames.

RQ5: Which newspaper framed the Pakistan Democratic Movement positively? The researchers analyzed The Nation and Daily Times and found out that the Daily Times positively supported and portrayed the PDM alliance. In routine practices of media, there are two ways to positively frame an issue, individual, matter, event, and organization, the first way is that the newspaper appreciates the efforts of one group, and the other practice is that it criticizes the activities of the other group. **Daily Times** used both the framing and slanting techniques to positively portray the Pakistan Democratic Movement. The words used by Daily Times to appreciate the PDM's manifesto and objectives are Polarized alliance vs government, establishment or the people are important; seeks PDM. The other slanting technique includes criticism of the Imran Khan Government that it needs reforms, what happened with the housing scheme, how the government will handle opposition protests, and a cartoon reflecting Buzdar is wearing boots bigger than his size.

RQ6: What is the difference between the framing of both newspapers? The major difference lies with the **choice of frames** The Nation used game framing to appreciate or simply state the activities of Imran Khan and used the negative frame to criticize the members of the Pakistan Democratic Movement and their statements against the military establishment. The other difference is that The Nation kept Pakistan Tehreek e Insaaf on the **upper half page** of the editorial page

and Daily Times kept representing the Pakistan Democratic Movement on the upper half editorial page.

RQ7: Which newspaper gave more Coverage to the Pakistan Democratic Movement? The Nation gave more coverage to the Pakistan democratic movement but the intention of frequently publishing editorials on this issue was to clear the image of

Imran Khan and to counter the criticism that the PTI government was facing. The total number of editorials published on the issue related to PDM on the editorial page of The Nation during the months (October, November, and December) is 105.

RQ8: Which newspaper used playing up the frame for the Pakistan Democratic Movement?

The newspaper that used the playing up technique for framing Pakistan

Democratic Movement (PDM) is the **Daily Times**. It placed all the editorials related to the Pakistan Democratic Movement on the upper half of the editorial page throughout the period of three months and gave it importance by allocating 3 to 4 columns to these editorials most of the time and positively framed the members of the Pakistan democratic movement.

The literature suggests that the headlines in the news and other newspaper articles are the reflection of the editor's subjective approach, his partisanship bias, and the inclined political policy of the newspaper (F Batool, 2021). The editorials of Daily Times exhibited Pro PDM policy as they gave more positive coverage to PDM objectives and members while The Nation remained biased towards criticizing PDM members mainly based on corruption and money laundering charges they hold. The prominent frames in both the newspapers were personalization and positive or negative framing of PDM. The gaming frame remained observable in The Nation whenever it commented on Imran Khan's plans and actions.

Framing of Pakistan Democratic Movement (PDM) in Pakistani English Leading Newspapers

References:

- Abram, N., Gattuso, J. P., Prakash, A., Cheng, L., Chidichimo, M. P., Crate, S., ... & Von Schuckmann, K. (2019). Framing and context of the report. *IPCC special report on the [ocean](#) and cryosphere in a changing climate*, 73-129.
- Albert, M. V., [Toledo](#), S., Shapiro, M., & Kording, K. (2012). Using [mobile](#) phones for activity recognition in Parkinson's patients. *Frontiers in neurology*, 3, 158.
- Becker, R. L., & MacKellar, A. D. (1984). Theoretical initial l dependence of ion-Rydbergatom collision cross sections. *Journal of [Physics](#) B: Atomic and Molecular [Physics](#) (19681987)*, 17(19), 3923.
- Bryant, J., & Miron, D. (2004). Theory and research in mass communication. *Journal of communication*.
- Butool, F., & Arshad, M. A. F. (2021). Ideology, Politics, and Media: A Critical Discourse Analysis of News Headline about Pakistan Democratic Movement.
- Cissel, M. (2012). Media Framing: a comparative content analysis on mainstream and alternative news coverage of Occupy Wall [Street](#). *The Elon Journal of Undergraduate Research in Communications*, 3(1), 67-77.
- Chomsky, N., & Noam, C. (2002). *On nature and language*. Cambridge [University](#) Press.
- Davies, P. J. (2022). The Media and Politics. In *Developments in American Politics* 9 (pp. 101-116). Palgrave Macmillan, Cham.
- Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Towards clarification of a fractured paradigm. *McQuail's reader in mass communication theory*, 390, 397.

Freyenberger, D. D. (2013). *Amanda Knox: A content analysis of media framing in newspapers around the world* (Doctoral dissertation, East Tennessee State [University](#)).

Hansen, A., Cottle, S., Negrine, R., & Newbold, C. (1998). *Mass communication research methods*. NYU Press.

Hoppman.Chaney, N., Jang, J. S., Jen, J., Babovic.Vuksanovic, D., & Hodge, J. C. (2012). In-frame multi-exon deletion of SMC1A in a severely affected female with Cornelia de Lange Syndrome. *American Journal of Medical Genetics Part A*, 158(1), 193-198.

Khan, T. M. (2021). Use of social media and WhatsApp to conduct teaching activities during the COVID-19 lockdown in Pakistan. *International Journal of Pharmacy Practice*, 29(1), 90-90.

Kosicki, G. M. (1993). Problems and opportunities in agenda-setting research. *Journal of Communication*, 43(2), 100-127.

LAZERSFELD, P. (1948). *The People's Choice: How the voter makes up in mind in a presidential election*. Nova Iorque, [Columbia University Press](#).

Lecheler, S., & De Vreese, C. H. (2019). *News framing effects: Theory and practice* (p. 138). Taylor & Francis.

Matthes, J. (2009). What's in a frame? A content analysis of media framing studies in the world's leading communication journals, 1990-2005. *Journalism & mass communication quarterly*, 86(2), 349-367.

Neuendorf, K. A. (2018). Content analysis and thematic analysis. In *Advanced research methods for applied [psychology](#)* (pp. 211-223). Routledge.

Oxford Analytica. (2020). New EU COVID restrictions come with political risks. *Emerald Expert Briefings*, (oxan-es).

Manufacturing Consent: United States Control on Main Stream Media

Book Review,
Manufacturing Consent: United States Control on Main Stream Media
(Propaganda Model Perspective)

Muhammad Kaqbad Alam

Ph.D Scholar, Department of Journalism and Mass Communication, University of
Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtoonkhwa, Pakistan

kaqbadalam@gmail.com

Dr. Faisal Aziz

Lecturer Department of Communication and Media Studies

University of Sargodha, Sargodha, Pakistan

faisal.aziz@uos.edu.pk

Sahrish Rahmat

Ph. D Scholar, Institute of Media and Communication Studies, Bahauddin Zakria
University Multan, Pakistan.

Pareeshyali786@gmail.com

Received March 16, 2023; Received in revised form August 18, 2023; Accepted August 25, 2023
Available online June 30, 2024

The date of Noam Chomsky's birth was December 7, 1928. He is by nature an American Nationalist. He is an accomplished linguist, social philosopher, social critic, cognitive and behavioral scientist, authentic historian, and one of the 20th century's most prominent political activists. He was referred to as "the father of modern linguistics" by researchers of his time. He helped establish the fields of cognitive

science and the Propaganda Model. In addition, he is the author of over 100 books on a variety of subjects, including linguistics, conflict, politics, mass communication, and mass media. He agrees with "anarcho-syndicalism and libertarian socialism" from an ideological perspective. Leading figures in media studies and linguistics of the twentieth century include Noam Chomsky. At the age of just 32, he was promoted to full professor at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. His 1957 publication "Syntactic Structures" revolutionized linguistics and profoundly altered how we currently perceive language and the mind.

Many worldwide universities and institutions have awarded Noam Chomsky with honorary degrees. Chomsky received the "Distinguished Scientific Contribution Award" for his highly regarded and influential linguistics work. At the young age of ten, Chomsky published his first political essay about the struggle against fascism in Spain, demonstrating his early political awareness. His past works include "The Abuse of Power and the Attack on Democracy", *Fateful Triangle*, *Necessary Illusions*, *Hegemony or Survival*, *Deterring Democracy* and *Failing States*, and *Towards a New Cold War*. Chomsky is most recognized in the field of linguistic philosophy for his critiques of the emergence of reference and meaning in human language. "Manufacturing Consent," one of his best pieces, distinguishes between the media's role in supporting and tolerating state programs.

Chomsky excelled academically and joined several groups and societies throughout his study period. The school's hierarchical and structured teaching techniques alarmed him. Chomsky relocated to Managua in 1985 during the Nicaraguan Contra to meet with supporters and displaced people. Noam Chomsky began inspiring people with talks on politics and linguistics. Chomsky traveled to the "Palestinian areas" in 1988 to observe the effects of Israeli occupation. Chomsky pioneered ideas on disliking capitalism and identifying material riches. He also grew disrespectful of authoritarian socialism, which the Soviet Union's Marxist-Leninist policies embodied. He suggests that a spectrum between complete democratic management of the economy and complete authoritarian control should be recognized rather than embracing the conventional perception among Americans. According to him, a democratic society is one in which "all persons have a say in public monetary policy," hence, Western capitalist countries are not truly democratic.

Manufacturing Consent: United States Control on Main Stream Media

In addition, Chomsky has made significant contributions to the philosophy of cognition, the philosophy of language, and the philosophy of science. People often express a desire for the budget to be diverted from military expenditures to other civil defense priorities, such as education, health care, and other civil services, during times of war propaganda. The largest owners and investors, however, decide that a defense budget is required for military expenses. Mainstream media in support of stockholders and investors take similar actions here. The media's coverage of this spectrum of subjects is very well suited to the propaganda paradigm. In the University of Pennsylvania's "Wharton School," Edward S. Herman teaches finance. His work contains books relating to Corporate Control, Corporate Power, The Real Terror Network, Terrorism in Fact and Propaganda, and The Rise and Fall of the Bulgarian Connection, etc. He is a member of the American Academy of Science.

Introduction

The main theme of Noam Chomsky's book "Manufacturing Consent" is the "propaganda model". This book offers an analytical approach that seeks to contextualize the performance of American mass media within the framework of fundamental institutional design. When it comes to media purposes, one is to spread propaganda on behalf of the strong and dominating social regimes (Mullen, & Klaehn, 2010). Instead of relegating divergent viewpoints, this book explains the political spectrum. According to Chomsky, censorship enforced by "free market" forces that are driven by the government is limited and more difficult to overturn. He also makes the case that since the mainstream media is controlled by corporations; it reflects their objectives and interests. These strong regimes oversee the content of the mass media and provide funding to the owners of the mainstream media. Following this training, the representatives of these interests have significant personal goals and ideals they aim to advance through the media. Such individuals hold influential positions in civil society, where they can influence and restrain media policy (Targema, & Ayih, 2017). This is typically not accomplished by simple media manipulation, but rather through the hiring of journalists and editors who share this viewpoint, internalization of priorities, and the defining of newsworthiness as it relates to media strategy.

The mass media's adherence to an official agenda and lack of opposition is likely to sway public opinion in the direction projected (Gitlin, 1977). When the public's interests drastically conflict with those of the elite in a matter of degree and interest, it is a source of great surprise. Tycoons in the media have their reliable sources of information, and the official narrative may be widely disputed. Although the number of very large corporations has decreased, the dominance of the media has increased, almost unchallenged by Republican and Democratic administrations and regulatory power. Ben Bagdikian claims in his research that since the publication of his first edition of *Media Monopoly* in 1983, fifty enormous enterprises have dominated nearly every mass media. Seven short years later, in 1990, only 23 companies still held the same dominant position (Bagdikian, 2004). Since 1990, waves of significant mergers and acquisitions and quick globalization have further concentrated the media industries into nine transnational companies.

Disney, AOL, Time Warner, Viacom, News Corporation, Bertelsmann, General Electric, Sony, AT&T-Liberty Media, and Vivendi Universal are some of these conglomerates. These conglomerates now control all of the major film studios, TV networks, and music labels worldwide because of their activities. Additionally, these businesses operated significant cable channels, cable systems, periodicals, major-market TV stations, and publishing houses (Herman, & Chomsky, 2021). If we take a global perspective, we will see that the US government and other Elite Western governments have pushed for the interests of their nation's businesses that are keen to grow abroad. The World Bank and the International Monetary Fund (IMF) have both adopted a similar strategy to improve transnational corporations' access to global media markets. Modern philosophy has provided the scholarly justification for preparations that have given private transnational speculators responsibility for stations, satellite linkages, and satellite frameworks (Fitzgerald, 2011).

The style of life and belief system promoted by the process of globalization is closely related to the "way of life" issues, goods, and their acquisition. The indication of the global media architecture is its persistent, pervasive corporate greed, writes Robert Mc Chesney. The productivity of individuals and groups has increased because of the internet and new technology. Yet, despite the internet's limits as a vital instrument, its invention has been a useful addition to the realm of mass

Manufacturing Consent: United States Control on Main Stream Media

communication (Smiers, 2003). The Internet is not a tool for mass communication; instead, it is used for different types of conversation. Only sizable businesses have been able to significantly increase consumer awareness of their products. The capitalist ideology's political structures are observed through a liberal-pluralist lens (Mullen, & Klaehn, 2010). These democratic societies imply that there is a thriving market for mass production and ideas. The liberal pluralist sees the mass media as a fourth-estate pillar.

The public interest is protected by the media, which also acts as "watchdogs" on the use of authority. The mass media make a substantial contribution to the modern democratic system of checks and balances in society. A huge step towards internet technology becoming a democratic media platform is the privatization of the internet's portals and servers and their integration into non-internet corporations. The rapid spread of internet technology by the top newspapers and media conglomerates during the past ten years of technological innovation has been widely observed. The major media outlets that have entered the online space have tended to focus more on selling products, reducing their news coverage, and offering features that appeal to viewers and advertisers right away (Norris, 2009).

United States Control on Main Stream Media

Bottom-line considerations have gained increasing influence in Western nations because of increased corporate power and worldwide influence, conglomerate meddling in the media sector, mergers and further media centralization, and the demise of public broadcasting. Advertising has grown more aggressively competitive. However, there are now even more gaps between editorial and advertising departments. These modifications have led to a deeper integration of newsrooms into global corporate edifices. Journalism that is entrenched and investigative has also questioned established power systems. The anti-communist worldview may have diminished with the fall of the Soviet Union, which also contributed to the virtual elimination of socialist movements worldwide (Croteau, et al, 2006). The success of capitalism and the growing influence of those interested in privatization and market rule has tightened the hold of market ideology, at least among the elite, so that

markets are considered benign and even democratic regardless of the available evidence. Although there are situations where private enterprises require government aid when conducting business abroad, nonmarket procedures are dubious. Journalism has assimilated this philosophy, which was put forth when the Soviet economy collapsed in the 1980s and was attributed to a lack of markets. On the other hand, the governments of Indonesia and Turkey have long been U.S. military allies and receivers of financial and economic support. The propaganda model would have predicted that the mainstream media would have paid little attention to Turkey's brutal treatment of Kurds during the 1990s (Herman, 1988).

Role of US media in international Conflicts

The extravagant assistance provided by the Clinton administration to Turkey in carrying out its ethnic cleansing program received media notice as well. The phrase "genocide" was rarely used in media coverage of Turkish operations for Kurds. Similar to how it was rarely used to describe Indonesia's abuse of East Timorese people, who in 1999 were subjected to yet another wave of terror as Indonesia sought to defeat a United Nations-sponsored referendum on independence. Compared to the treatment of Kurds in Turkey in the 1990s, this mistreatment was almost certainly less severe (Herman, & Peterson, 2010). The paramilitary opposition to a United Nations-sponsored independence referendum was planned and worked with the Indonesian Military. In 1966 and 1969, Laos carried out chemical assaults. These assaults target locals' communication channels, agriculture, and greenery. Agent Orange was also heavily used on 173,000 acres of Cambodian forests, cereals, and rubber plantations. Owing to this loss, the Cambodian government vehemently denounced this harsh and illegal action for violating its neutrality, but sadly, the government of Cambodia was too small and weak for its voice to be heard (Clymer, 2013).

Because of these repercussions, the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) vehemently denounced the deployment of chemical weapons in Cambodia as a violation of international law, but it was helpless to take action against the US government, and there was no international community movement to stop it. In the second month of 1997, The Wall Street Journal ran a front-page story about the possibility that 500,000 babies were born with dioxin-related abnormalities during Bill Clinton's presidency (Ortega, 001). This story looked into the idea that the US

Manufacturing Consent: United States Control on Main Stream Media

government ought to bear some of the blame for this catastrophe. In addition, this tale brought attention to additional American misdeeds, but it rejected the notion that the country, emotionally depleted from losing the war, paid little attention. However, the United States accepted absolutely no accountability for the state of its victims. It was established that chemical weapons were widely used against South Vietnam during the Vietnam War. One explanation for this was that the employment of these heinous and unlawful weapons against North Vietnam would have been extensively publicized because it had an ally-supported government (Merom, 2003). To disregard the oppressed South Vietnamese people and maintain unrelenting aggression, the United States and its client regime engaged South Vietnam.

The mass media ought to act in a socially responsible manner; however, they not only downplayed the violence but also failed to draw attention to the contradiction and its importance. According to a piece by Barbara Crossette, an embedded journalist with the New York Times, it was unfortunate that the United States did not participate in any way in researching the impacts of chemical warfare in Vietnam. Since the United States had only used dioxin on those. It was allegedly protecting against aggression, neither Crossett nor any other mainstream reporter had anything to say about the fact that Vietnam had been used as a controlled experiment in the effects of dioxin on humans from which much could be learned that would be beneficial to us (Chomsky, & Herman, 1979).

The Propaganda Model by Noam Chomsky

The purpose and objectives of mass media are very broad, and it serves as a means of getting messages, signals, and symbols over to the intended audience. The purpose of mass media is to inform, entertain, and indoctrinate individuals with values, beliefs, and moral principles. People will be integrated into the institutional framework of the greater society through this process. In various nations where the levers of power are in the hands of a government, a systematic propaganda approach is needed to attain these roles from mass media. In any media company where the media is private and censorship is not present, it is highly challenging to detect a propaganda system (Luhmann, 2000). This wealth and power disparity and its multiple consequences on

the general populace are the subjects of a propaganda model. Media practices follow the path of communication where capitalism and power are intimately involved in media content filtering and allowing the government and dominant business interests to communicate with the public.

The propaganda model's main interest is in how the media affects society. Several researchers of mass media returned to the traditional Marxist view of ideology in the early 1960s, focusing on the idea that the ideas of the ruling class are in every period the governing ideas (Cottle, 2006). Researchers created these novel ideas to understand and illuminate the function of the media in contemporary democracies. This research effectively advanced the mass society paradigm, which won the early 1920s to the late 1930s period of mass media effects. The propaganda model was created to describe how the American mass media functioned and dominated on rest of the media. In addition, this paradigm works well in nations with very differing political and media landscapes. The propaganda Model, according to theoretical researchers, could benefit European media. Overall, changes in politics and political communication over the past few decades have tended to make the propaganda model more applicable (Pedro-Caraana, Etal, 2018). The following categories can be used to group the crucial components of a propaganda model for the collection of news "filters".

- The scale, close ownership, and profit-driven nature of the dominant mass media companies
- Advertising serves as the primary revenue source for all mainstream media;
- The mainstream media's reliance on information from primary sources and agents of power including the government, business, and "experts" they finance and authorize.
- The use of "Flak" to punish the media and the term "Flak" to refer to negative reactions to media statements; and
- "Anticommunism" as a national religion and control mechanism.

These fundamental components of the propaganda model work in concert to reinforce one another. The news's source material must go through a series of filters. The

Manufacturing Consent: United States Control on Main Stream Media

definition of what is noteworthy in the first place, as well as the premises of conversation and interpretation, is fixed using these filters. These filters also describe the rationale and methods of what are essentially propaganda campaigns (Mullen, 2010).

US Media Coverage in Indo-China War

The way the American conflicts in Vietnam have been covered by the mass media has generated a lot of ugly criticism. The consensus is that the mass media lost the war by making the public aware of its horrors and by providing unfair, subpar, and biased coverage. The best illustration of this animosity for established military power is the mass media's coverage of offense (Hallin, 1989). A propaganda model produces several outcomes. A propaganda model leads us to anticipate that the media would not be criticized for its gullible embrace of the American compassion philosophy in the second-level discussion on the performance of the mass media. This practice undermines the role of democratic institutions. It should be restricted forcefully either by the media themselves or by government agencies. The question would be whether the media should be held accountable for undermining the good cause by taking an excessively argumentative posture and losing any sense of fairness and objectivity as a result. There is not much disagreement over Soviet intervention.

Further security worries for the Soviet Union in Eastern Europe include other nations resultantly the Nazis in an attack on the Soviet Union. Afghanistan borders regions of the Soviet Union where a radical Islamic fundamentalist revival might incite the populace (Weiner, 1992). The Soviet Union's worst adversaries openly supported these insurgents. Yet, none of these issues excuses the Soviet Union's war on Czechoslovakia. A government with some semblance of legitimacy invited the Russians into Afghanistan in 1979, but as the Economist correctly noted, an invader is an invader unless invited in. These ideas mimic the class-based basis of mass society as well as the laws, customs, and regulations that are supported to establish and uphold ruling class dominance. They said that the media had more influence starting in the middle of the 1960s. The ways that different research papers explain how the mass media are determined are varied (Garrity, 1980).

US Media Role in Legitimizing versus Meaningless Third World Elections

The best place to test a propaganda model is during elections in developing nations. To legitimize their rulers and regimes, some elections are rigged in benevolent client states. To validate their political and economic systems, certain elections are staged in nations that are viewed negatively or as enemies. Elections in the friendly client states are frequently held under United States sponsorship, which strengthens this trend. As a result, in the Dominican Republic in 1996, the United States held elections in its client states that have come to be known as demonstration elections, which are those whose main goal is to persuade the local populace that the intervention is well-intentioned (Snow, 2011). The United States government employs a variety of tactics to promote the elections it supports. Additionally, it has a clear agenda of disagreements that it wants to be highlighted as well as disagreements. Technology is used to manipulate symbols and agendas to promote the preferred election. The sponsoring government makes an effort to tie the election campaign to the military rule it supports by using the happy word democracy to do so (Gross, 2002).

The sponsoring government also pays close attention to any dissident remarks calling for abstention threats to scuttle the election. They are utilized to turn the election into a dramatic conflict. The agenda of the United States administration is turned on its side when elections are observed in unfriendly and hostile states. Elections are no longer equated with controlled democracy and American officials are no longer astounded that the election was held in a non-democratic manner. They do not give the military credit for backing the vote and pledging to respect the outcome (Chesnut, 1997). On the other hand, when the dominant party's influence over and support from the military is highlighted, in this case as exposing the integrity of the election, this is referred to as a form of advantage. The focus right now is on the secret motivations of the election sponsors, who are attempting to legitimate themselves through this cunning scheme of a so-called election.

Conclusion

In this book, Herman and Chomsky present a "propaganda model" to explain the international affairs bias in Western media, particularly the US media. Their argument is even though the United States is not a dictatorship where a single person has the

Manufacturing Consent: United States Control on Main Stream Media

power to censor the press. The market forces that cause people to believe in press freedom work to create self-imposed censorship that results in a biased media that is more concerned with delivering audiences to its advertisers and important corporate sponsors than giving its readers accurate and balanced news. Noam Chomsky emphasizes three important points and provides several instances to support his argument. However, Herman and Chomsky can support their claim that US media reports are biased to portray the US and its allies as the good guys and other (enemy) states as the "bad guys" by using extensive quotations. US contemporary media reports follow these notions with official sources such as government documents, White House memos, State Department press releases, as well as reports in non-US-based mass media. Although the US media did not agree, it is notable that they may criticize Nicaragua's restrictions on press freedom. These limitations were far more straightforward and noteworthy. The use of this separation procedure has led to the employment of a double standard by the authors of several American newspapers in the same article. They do not seem to be conscious of their prejudice. Whether the army and the US will give up authority and control is a question. US mass media observers gave an excellent illustration of how to employ government-controlled experts and pseudo-events to interest the media and push subjective propaganda narratives. The administration chooses these official observers from recognized organizations based on their trustworthiness. These experts' observations will influence the opinions and policies of the subject countries. In the same way, the regular use of these official observers by the media to remark on the quality of elections breaches norms of substantive objectivity.

People hold the misconception that the press is combative, tenacious, and pervasive in its pursuit of facts and the truth. Edward Herman and Noam Chomsky discuss the function of American media as an underlying exclusive consensus that essentially shapes all sides of the news in Noam Chomsky's book *Manufacturing Consent*. The mass media makes a concerted effort to identify and reflect its presumptions since they are undermining existing power and upper-class observations. The market and the financing of publishing are expertly and comprehensively dissected in *Manufacturing Consent* as significant influences on the news industry. The book's author discusses the framing of issues, topic selection, and media biases that underlie

claims of free elections, a free press, and governmental dominance. The authors also conclude that modern mass media can best be described in terms of a propaganda paradigm given the growth of technology. Corporations in the news, information, and entertainment swear to make money inside the established system.

Interests in the corporate sector include supporting governance expectations of both public and private authorities. The propaganda model's implications make media professionals, journalists, editors, and broadcasters seem bad. Nonetheless, twenty years after its initial publication, *Manufacturing Consent* continues to be the most significant indictment of the mass media. Media professionals, contemporary critics, and linguists regard Chomsky as the debatably most significant living thinker of the twenty-first century. Edward S. Herman and Noam Chomsky as obstinate, relentless, and all-pervasive in their pursuit of the truth and the upholding of justice in the news media typically portray the news media in this amazing book. Instead of practicing journalism, the media is defending the economic, social, and political goals of the privileged elite that dominate domestic society, the state, the government, and the international order. This great work is based on several case studies and experimental experiments, including the unfair treatment of worthy and unworthy victims in the media. Elections in third-world nations are being legitimized and made meaningless by the media. Media criticism of the US wars in Vietnam is being demoralized by the ruling class and ruling media. Herman and Chomsky put a Propaganda Model in this book because of their decades of criticism and study to explain the effectiveness and eligibility of the media. This study book examines the extent to which the Propaganda Model, developed by Edward S. Herman and Noam Chomsky in *Manufacturing Consent*, applies to media concepts. This propaganda model applies to discussions in the US media on how the US government ought to react to the killings committed by Ugandan warlord Joseph Kony.

This study book also demonstrates that the concept of worthy and unworthy about the general function of the media does not adequately meet American geopolitical and economic goals in the Central African area. The relative absence of civil liberties in Ugandan society as a supporter of the United States, atrocities committed by the Ugandan army, and claims of American assistance for Ugandan government policies are all detailed in the book. The media emphasize humanitarian issues rather than

Manufacturing Consent: United States Control on Main Stream Media

performing investigative reporting. As a result, these data lend credibility to Herman and Chomsky's propaganda theory. This book review goes on to investigate the astounding effectiveness of the propaganda paradigm. This work's masterful analysis of the propaganda model paradigm mostly focuses on Western media. The performance and structural behavior of the traditional media system in the United States were critiqued using this propaganda model as a framework.

Suggestions and Recommendations

This evaluation is wholly dependent on the book *The Propaganda Model* book's framework is highlighted more. Herman and Chomsky changed it into "Manufacturing Consent," which implies that dominating specialized classes and elites creates consent and common understanding. A few profit-seeking owners run every major mass media enterprise. The open flow of news and analysis that is opposed to their interest is not encouraged by mass media. As a result, it is more common for pseudo-realities to be created and distributed to the media. This is a convincing argument for why the writers of this study book chose to use the propaganda model to assess how well the American mass media performs. American mass media investigated the primary print and broadcast platforms while using the propaganda model as the foundation of their organization. The emergence of democratic societies asserted that everyone had a right to accurate information and knowledge. No one's fundamental human rights may be violated. Everyone received the concept of self-respect as a result. As people on the subcontinent learned about their rights through the media, the same concept spread there. They also developed their press and newspapers because of this knowledge. According to Chomsky's propaganda, model, Western media has an understanding of the psychology of warfare. If we examine how Western media operates, we will see that psychological warfare is a crucial component of mass media. The media in the Muslim world and the developing globe is far too behind to protect the interests of the populace. Finally, yet importantly, the two authors of this book attempted to criticize viewpoints while looking for the propaganda model from that perspective. Indeed, media like radio, television, and newspapers should not be used for propaganda.

References

- Bagdikian, B. H. (2004). *The new media monopoly: A completely revised and updated edition with seven new chapters*. Beacon Press.
- Chesnut, R. A. (1997). *Born again in Brazil: The Pentecostal boom and the pathogens of poverty*. Rutgers University Press.
- Chomsky, N., & Herman, E. S. (1979). *The Washington connection and third world fascism* (Vol. 1). South End Press.
- Clymer, K. (2013). *The United States and Cambodia, 1969-2000: a troubled relationship*. Routledge.
- Cottle, S. (2006). *Mediatized conflicts*. McGraw-Hill Education (UK).
- Croteau, D., Hoynes, W., & Hoynes, W. D. (2006). *The business of media: Corporate media and the public interest*. Pine Forge Press.
- Deibert, R., Palfrey, J., Rohozinski, R., & Zittrain, J. (Eds.). (2011). *Access contested: security, identity, and resistance in Asian cyberspace*. MIT Press.
- Fitzgerald, S. W. (2011). *Corporations and cultural industries: Time Warner, Bertelsmann, and news corporation*. Lexington Books.
- Garrity, P. J. (1980). The Soviet Military Stake in Afghanistan: 1956–79. *The RUSI Journal*, 125(3), 31-36.
- Gitlin, T. A. (1977). " *THE WHOLE WORLD IS WATCHING*": *MASS MEDIA AND THE NEW LEFT, 1965-70*. University of California, Berkeley.
- Gross, P. (2002). *Entangled evolutions: Media and democratization in Eastern Europe*. Woodrow Wilson Center Press.
- Hallin, D. C. (1989). *The uncensored war: The media and Vietnam*. Univ of California Press.
- Herman, E. S. (1988). a Noam CHOMSKY. *Manufacturing consent: the political economy of the mass media*.

Manufacturing Consent: United States Control on Main Stream Media

- Herman, E. S. (1992). *Beyond hypocrisy: Decoding the news in an age of propaganda: Including a doublespeak dictionary for the 1990s*. Black Rose Books Ltd..
- Herman, E. S., & Chomsky, N. (2021). *Manufacturing Consent*. In *Power and Inequality* (pp. 198-206). Routledge.
- Herman, E. S., & Peterson, D. (2010). *The politics of genocide*. NYU Press.
- Herman, Edward, and Noam Chomsky (2012). "17 A Propaganda Model." *Media and cultural studies: Keywords* 204 (2012).
- Klaehn, J. (2002). A Critical Review and Assessment of Herman and Chomsky's Propaganda Model'. *European Journal of Communication*, 17(2), 147-182.
- Klaehn, J., & Mullen, A. (2010). The propaganda model and sociology: Understanding the media and society. *Synaesthesia: Communication Across Cultures*, 1(1), 10-23.
- Luhmann, N. (2000). *The reality of the mass media* (p. 1). Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Merom, G. (2003). *How democracies lose small wars: state, society, and the failures of France in Algeria, Israel in Lebanon, and the United States in Vietnam*. Cambridge University Press.
- Mullen, A. (2010). Twenty years on The second-order prediction of the Herman-Chomsky propaganda model. *Media, Culture & Society*, 32(4), 673-690.
- Mullen, A., & Klaehn, J. (2010). The Herman–Chomsky propaganda model: A critical approach to analyzing mass media behavior. *Sociology Compass*, 4(4), 215-229.
- Norris, P. (Ed.). (2009). *Public Sentinel: News media and governance reform*. World Bank Publications.
- Ortega, M. (2001). *Military intervention and the European Union* (Vol. 45). Institute for Security Studies, Western European Union.

- Pedro-Carañana, J., Broudy, D., & Klaehn, J. (2018). *The Propaganda Model Today*. University of Westminster Press.
- Roos, J. (2012). Nationalism, Racism and Propaganda in Early Weimar Germany: Contradictions in the Campaign against the 'Black Horror on the Rhine'. *German History*, 30(1), 45-74.
- Smiers, J. (2003). *Arts under pressure: promoting cultural diversity in the age of globalization*. Zed Books.
- Snow, N. (2011). *Information war: American propaganda, free speech, and opinion control since 9-11*. Seven Stories Press.
- Targema, T. S., & Ayih, L. J. (2017). Nature and System of Media Ownership and Control in Nigeria: Implication for Grassroots Participation and Development. *Nairobi Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences (NJHS)*, 1(7), 53-65.
- Weiner, M. (1992). Security, stability, and international migration. *International security*, 17(3), 91-126.

Adaptation of Digital Tools in Higher Education Institutes: A Review Paper

Asim Razzaq

asim.razzaq@vu.edu.pk

Department of Mass Communication, Virtual University of Pakistan, Islamabad

Abstract:

Nowadays, young people's lives are influenced by social digital tools all the time. People use social networks for more than just entertainment and information. They also use them in a lot of different ways in the classroom for educational purposes. This article review tries to show how digital tools are used in higher education, as well as point out some of the factors that play a role in this. The goal of this review is to learn more about how students and teachers use digital tools to help them learn, as well as how these tools are used in higher education. In the last 10 years, more research has been done to find out what's good about using social networks for educational purposes. In this review, the researcher looked at relevant information from research journals and talked about issues, problems, and possible solutions. The researcher only looked at articles that showed how online digital tools helped education, especially higher education. Researchers looked at 25 articles from 2010 and later that were published in different journals. They found that Facebook and Twitter are the most popular online digital platforms used for education.

Keywords: *Social media, Digital learning and teaching, Higher education institutes*

Received January 13, 2024; Received in revised form June 16, 2024; Accepted June 25, 2024
Available online June 30, 2024

Introduction

In the last ten years or so, online digital tools and how we use them have become part of our everyday lives. They have changed the way young people live and are now one of the most important ways to talk to each other and have fun. Because of this, people in the education field worry that students aren't as interested in learning as they used to be, which can hurt their grades and even cause them to drop out of

school. To make students more aware of what is going on in the classroom, a blend of entertainment and informational behavior patterns has been suggested. People who use social networks are likely to do this, and this seems to be a fun and common way for students to live their lives. People all over the world use social media every single day. They are mostly used by young people, and they use them a lot.

Dahlstrom (2018) says that 90 percent of students in the United States talk to each other on Facebook, while 37 percent do the same thing on Twitter. According to another study done in this country, about 71% of college students use Facebook. Facebook may be one of the most used social networks for both personal and educational purposes. Social networks are used by academic institutions to handle educational issues on the inside. The researcher only looked at articles that showed how online digital tools helped education, especially higher education. Researchers looked at 25 articles from 2010 and later that were published in different journals. They found that Facebook and Twitter are the most popular online digital platforms used for education.

In 10 articles, Facebook was either the only online platform mentioned or the main one. In 6 articles, Twitter was the main educational tool, and in four articles, other social networks like Myspace, Google+, LinkedIn, and others were mentioned. All five of the remaining articles were about social networks (Tess, 2013; Dahlstrom, 2018). All of the articles have been put into four different categories to show how digital tools have a positive effect and how they are used; How students and teachers look at the learning process, Personality and learning style of the user, Online learning platforms, and other digital tools and Use in institutions.

How students and teachers look at the learning process using digital tools?

During the last ten years, social networks have been used in both formal and informal learning in new ways. Formal learning is a system of education that is set up in levels, like nursery school, elementary school, high school, and university. It includes academic studies, specialized training, and vocational and technical learning programs for people of all ages. Informal learning is the way each person learns and gains attitudes, values, knowledge, and skills directly from his or her everyday life and social environment. This is also called "learning by doing" or "learning for life."

Adaptation of Digital Tools in Higher Education Institutes

So, some studies show that students mostly use Facebook to stay in touch with their friends, while others say that students' use of Facebook affects their education, either directly or indirectly. Also, almost 90% of the more than 600 students who took part in a similar study at Pakistan's Islamia University in Bahawalpur said that they also use Facebook for schoolwork. Also, 71.25 percent of 160 philosophers and social scientists at the University of Delhi said they used Facebook as part of their research into collaborative learning processes (Madhusudhan, 2012).

Camiel et al. (2014) did a thorough review of the literature and found that there aren't many works that show how social networks help education in a good way. When this happens, digital tools are mostly used for informal learning (like asking "friends" for help or asking them to point out some hard topics). Also, the people who wrote this study point out that there aren't enough relevant references and wonder if digital tools can be used effectively as educational tools. Ainin (2015) said that the social interactions students have through social networks "help students feel more connected to the college, which may increase the likelihood that they will stay in college after their first year." Also, the authors think that Facebook is the best social network for helping students with their schoolwork.

In Israel, more than 70 Facebook and Twitter accounts were set up by universities to help with education, according to a survey. Because of this, a network that supports informal learning was made, and the results of spreading knowledge were very good. Furthermore, the influence of digital tools on students at Griffith University in Australia in terms of self-esteem. They noticed that students were learning better, so they said that digital tools have become an important part of their learning process (Tower, 2014).

In another article, more than 160 philosophers and social scientists at Delhi University in India said that they preferred to do their research with digital tools because they helped them do their research better (Madhusudhan, 2012). Students in pharmacology at Boston University shared similar ideas. They saw that Twitter could help them build their learning network, which they called a PLN (personal learning network). A personal learning network (PLN) is "a group of resources that people use to learn more and learn on their own" (Camiel et al., 2014).

Improving the way of education with the help of digital tools

Cheung (2011) says that using digital tools to learn opens up new ways of looking at things. Most of the time, social networking sites let students learn in both formal and informal ways. For example, they can study course material or look for useful information everywhere. Students can connect with people who think like them and share knowledge in an informal way, such as by talking about their school experiences. This is done for educational purposes. For example, first-year students can talk to older students to find out everything they need to know about their faculty. This will help them get used to their new school life. More specifically, the research showed that 20% of German students use StudiVZ, which is like the German version of Facebook, to share information about their studies.

Similarly, Hussain (2012) noticed that when students share their learning experiences using digital tools, it helps build a virtual community around the world. Also, a USM (Universiti Sains Malaysia) article showed that 300 students think that Facebook is a valuable and important tool that can help them improve their English language skills. In other articles, Australian professors from management, arts, humanities studies, information technology, and health services talked about how students are asked to use social networks to create and share their work. The results showed that letting students' work be seen by others through social networks opens up new ways to learn, but could also cause problems. Students' worries about copying became clear. They didn't feel safe when their work was posted online, and they were very afraid that other students would do "bad things" online. However, the article's authors concluded that we need to think about "students' views and ask more questions about the main issues that can make it hard to use social web technologies effectively in higher education" (Waycott, 2013).

Academic results while using digital tools

All of the above articles bring up several good points about how social network use can help and improve education, as well as lead to successful educational outcomes. They look at how digital tools might affect things like social learning, communication, academic culture, etc., and they support the idea that social networks

Adaptation of Digital Tools in Higher Education Institutes

can make schools run more smoothly and improve (or at least expect to improve) student performance (Mazer, 2007).

Mazer (2017) talked about how the use of digital tools can help students do better in school. But there don't seem to be any measurable academic outcomes. For example, no one has kept track of how long a student uses digital tools or how well she or he does in school because of them. Review and personal experience in this field don't back up facts like the following: If a student uses Facebook every day to study, they can expect to do well on their tests. Or, most of the best students use digital tools to study.

Paul et al. (2012) say that "academic performance is a function of attention span, time management skills, student characteristics, and academic competence." More specifically, some people worry about whether or not students will finally feel socially accepted when they publish their work using digital tools, or about the possibility of plagiarism or the possibility that their views will be rejected. Also, Paul et al. (2012) found that the amount of time students spend on digital tools has a statistically significant negative effect on how well they do in school.

Junco (2015) seems to agree with this point in part since they say that "time spent on Facebook was significantly related to a lower GPA for freshmen but not for other students." In the literature, grade point average (GPA) is the only way to measure how well students do in college and how well they do in school. Michikyan et al. (2015), on the other hand, said that there is also a relationship in the opposite direction: that is, students' grades could be used to estimate how much they use Facebook. Their research shows that college students who are having trouble with their studies and aren't doing as well (as shown by a lower GPA) turn to social networks to get help.

In line with the above, Michikyan et al. (2015) looked into what distracts students while they study. They found that using social networks for education causes low performance. So that students could focus better, they suggested small, planned "technological breaks" to cut down on distractions. Students, for their part, like to use social networks during study time, even though this is thought to be inefficient. Rosmala (2012) says that students and teachers use free Internet access during work

hours not only to have fun, but also to communicate, share ideas and information, and help with teaching. Based on their work, it's clear that the most important thing is not to decide to limit access to digital tools, but to find a way that works well for everyone. Finally, Paul et al. (2012) pointed out that even if students are fully convinced that digital tools help them learn, they still don't use them on their own. Instead, they expect their teachers to do it for them.

How to communicate and collaborate using digital tools

As we've already talked about, there are different ideas about how digital tools can help students do well in school. On the other hand, there is more agreement that they help education providers talk to each other and work together. First of all, communication using more traditional Information and Computer Technology (ICT) tools (like e-mail and instant messaging) or digital tools (the modern way) seems to be independent of users' previous "technological adequacy" or digital literacy. Digital literacy is the ability to use electronic devices (smartphones, computers, etc.) easily and to understand how they work.

But just a few years ago, it was said that using a computer to talk to other people seemed to make it easier to learn new computer learning systems. Students who used digital tools seemed to be able to use computer learning systems (computer-supported collaborative learning or CSCL) more freely. Most research articles agree, in one way or another, that social networks and digital tools help students work together in general (Munoz, 2018).

Muhamad (2018), who agrees with this point of view, also pointed out several good things about using social networks in e-learning environments. For example, he said that using Facebook to find ways for students to work together to learn is a good example of this. Also, Madhusudhan (2012) showed that collaborative learning can be improved by using digital tools. The answers of 71.25 percent of the 160 students who took part in a study at Delhi University in India proved this.

As an extra factor, almost 90% of the 600 students who took part in a similar study at Pakistan's Islamia University said that Facebook is helpful enough for their academic activities, especially for sharing information with colleagues from other countries (Hussain, 2012). In Australia, a study with students who did empirical

Adaptation of Digital Tools in Higher Education Institutes

research using digital tools found similar results. The students were excited and seemed to be sufficiently motivated by the social learning situations they encountered. The social part of learning is just as important as the intellectual part, and these two parts should never be separated when trying to learn (Waycott, 2013).

Educators perspective

It seemed like teachers didn't support using social networking and digital tools in the classroom as much as their students did. In Greece, people feel the same way. Students are more open to using Facebook in school than their teachers, even though teachers say it's more about entertainment and information (Tsoni et al., 2015). In another study of teachers from Canada, the United States, South Africa, the United Kingdom, and Australia, only a small number said they would consider using Facebook as part of their teaching strategy. This was true even though several studies had already been published that suggested ways to use technology to improve education and urged teachers to try them out, promising very good results (Visagie, 2010).

Indicatively, Deng (2013) told teachers and software developers how to promote their online courses and how platforms for online courses, like Moodle, can become more successful. In the same work, teachers are told to use Facebook's "social nature" to improve their communication and cooperation with their students and get them more involved in the learning process. The research of Waycott (2013), which was mentioned above, was a good example of how digital tools can help people work together. It is also a good example of how to get teachers excited about using digital tools in the classroom. Even though students were worried about losing their intellectual property rights or having bad things said about their published work, teachers were excited about the good results.

Hew (2013) also says that when teachers tell students more about what they do and how they do things in the classroom, students' expectations about how trustworthy they are change for the better. In general, digital platforms seem like another tool that teachers should use to get to know their students better and encourage them to use digital tools for learning more. This will help improve their

(students') educational experience, keep them motivated to learn, change education for the better, and "extend the learning process beyond the boundaries of a traditional classroom." A student-centered approach can also give students a chance to be more involved in the learning process by making the classroom a more flexible and creative place to learn.

On the other hand, as we've already said, educators seem to be hesitant. Do they trust social networks, or do they want more proof that what they're doing is working? Are they afraid of the new methods and the changes they bring, or do they prefer the safety of the "traditional" process? In any case, they are "likely in an experimental stage of implementation as they look for alignment between course activities and SNS (social networking site) applications." This is, of course, something that always happens when trying to use new technology in the classroom and curriculum (Omar et al., 2013).

Personality and learning style of the users with digital tools

Digital tools seem to affect and be affected by a person's personality and behavior. We've already talked about a few ways in which they affect young people. It is interesting to see how digital tools affect students' behavior, whether it is for the better or the worse. Also, young people who feel lonely have a lot of Facebook friends to help them feel less alone. In the same study, however, self-esteem, narcissism, and neuroticism were not linked to Facebook in a strong enough way. In another study, however, it was shown that there is a strong link between using Facebook often and feeling better about yourself. Also, 52.5% of the students who took part in the study at the University of Delhi in India said that one of the benefits of using Facebook in their research is that it makes them feel better about themselves and more satisfied (Madhusudhan, 2012).

In a similar study done in the United States (Kelling, 2013) about how people wanted a university to close because of protests, students chose more traditional ways to get information. Instead of using social networks, they chose to write or talk to politicians or sign protest memos to show they didn't agree. Students' cognitive behavior seems to improve, which is another way in which social networks might be good for them. In a similar study, it was found that regular Facebook users do better

Adaptation of Digital Tools in Higher Education Institutes

on tests of cognitive skills, which look at things like spelling, memory use, and verbal skills. They are also more accurate in what they say and get distracted less often.

Omar et al. (2012) talked about these effects and showed how students could use digital tools to improve their language expression skills so that they could better show different meanings when talking online. Kelling (2013), on the other hand, says that using digital tools for social entertainment (like online games, blogging, chatting, etc.) hurts text comprehension while using online search tools (like online newspapers, dictionaries, encyclopedias, and general search terms) helps reading go more quickly. Research shows that nothing on Facebook hurts learning in any way. For example, online chatting or games may be bad for activities related to the curriculum, but responses in comments, presenting facts, and giving a simple photo overview seem to be good for educational processes.

More interesting are the ideas that social networks can be part of a new (called "new millennial") way of learning that uses all of the new ways and tools of our technology. This style involves a lot of people using tools from more than one type of technology, searching in more than one way, putting together different pieces of information, and actively learning through both real and virtual/simulated situations. In the end, it's not clear whether digital tools change students' personalities for the better or the worse. It seems, though, that they often change the way they learn to fit in better with how people learn today (Kelling, 2013).

Online learning platforms and other digital tools

Support for course management systems (CMS) or learning management systems (LMS), as they are also known, is another part of social networking education. Cho (2007) found a few years ago that students who had already used social networking were more likely to use computer learning systems (also called computer-supported collaborative learning, or CSCL). This forced them to come up with ways to add digital features to these systems. They talked about the possibility that digital tools could help students and teachers work together in the classroom, and they made suggestions for how this could improve learning.

Gray's (2013) research became more and more focused on how to use digital tools and LMS together to help students learn. In particular, they suggested an environment that works like a social network. This system could pull educational data from different LMSs and use it to increase learning resources and make useful analyses for both teachers and students. Mohamad (2022) showed a simpler way to do things, which involves integrating the use of social networks into an e-learning environment. This research shows that there are good results when it comes to getting people interested in learning and understanding teaching concepts.

An interesting article In the field of nursing, LaRue (2012) showed good results. It meant that the teacher's job changed from being a teacher to being a director or coordinator and that the students' jobs changed from just getting information to making it. In this case, Facebook was used by the professor as a CMS (computer management system) to give information and instructions to the students. In turn, the students had to put all of these things together and use them correctly in an active and exploratory way to bring knowledge closer.

Effective use of digital tools in institutions

The work described by Kravvaris et al. (2018) is one of the few large-scale and successful examples of how an educational institution has used social networks to improve the way they teach. Because of this, there doesn't seem to be much change in how educational institutions use social networks for organizational purposes. Studies have shown that faculty members are slow to incorporate social networks into how their institutions work or how they do their work in the classroom. They like more common ways, like e-mail. At the same time, there is a big difference in how students and teachers think about Facebook's educational value: students have much higher expectations than teachers. Educational institutions sometimes don't let students use social networks during work hours, based on the belief that using digital tools hurts students' grades (Brooks, 2015).

But in a study done at three private universities in Indonesia, 60% of the people who took part said they use social networks at work not just for fun, but also to spread information. They set up ways to talk that help with educational activities, like making announcements, rescheduling tasks, talking about test questions, and so on (Rosmala, 2012). The institutions would be smarter to use digital tools if they

Adaptation of Digital Tools in Higher Education Institutes

designed and put in place the right rules for how to use them on their property, always keeping in mind how people act in these environments. This was tried in Israel's universities, which created 47 Facebook accounts and 26 Twitter accounts to help students get educational information.

These accounts worked alongside the "real" work of the institution and were used to share knowledge by making it easier for people to learn on their own. In contrast to what social networks usually show, the students kept these accounts active. This shows that the academic community in Israel liked what these institutions were doing, and it shows that people have higher hopes for how university institutions and social networks will work together. In conclusion, faculty members, like teachers, are not as excited about using digital tools in the classroom as their students are (Forkosh-Baruch, 2012).

Conclusion

During this review, the researcher used the Google Scholar Advance Search tab to try to compare 25 articles written after 2010. The first thing to notice is that scientists and academics are very interested in how social networks can be used to teach. Also, even though this scientific field was thought to be weak a few years ago. An article review showed that Facebook is the most popular social network, and it also showed some ways that digital tools are being used in educational events. First, these trends have to do with learning from all kinds of sources (e.g., support, upgrading of educational processes, cooperation, and performance). Second, they are mostly concerned with how users learn and who they are, and less with how things are set up.

The results of this article's review look pretty good for making digital tools work well in education. There was almost unanimous agreement that they helped students talk to each other and work together for educational purposes. It seemed like most researchers agreed that digital tools could help teach. While research efforts have been shown, it has also been noted that researchers are having a hard time getting independent empirical data on how students might do better in institutions. Some of them even argue against good things. Almost all of the research showed that digital tools have a positive effect on other factors that contribute to successful

educational action, such as communication, cooperation, and academic culture. Even though studies tell teachers to use social networks in the classroom, it doesn't seem like they want to. Of course, this seems to slow down the addition of more real-world data to research. Some research has also looked at how digital tools might affect the personalities and thinking of students. The results are almost positive, but there are a few problems.

They found that some students' self-esteem had gone up, that other students liked them more, that they could remember things better, and that they did better on tests of cognitive language skills. Most of the criticism is based on the kinds of things people do on social networks, with the idea that not all of them are helpful. For example, chatting and playing online games don't seem to help as much as searching for information and reviewing and describing events. Also, some studies don't seem to agree with what students think about using digital tools for educational and institutional purposes, even though most students think this is a good idea. This could be because teachers are holding back until all the good results have been confirmed and written down. In either case, it keeps empirical evidence from adding to research. On the one hand, this review seems to confirm the hope that empirical data will show the link between digital tools and good academic results. On the other hand, it makes it harder for teachers to use digital tools in a big way and in a positive way in their classrooms.

References

Ainin, S.; Naqshbandi, M.M.; Moghavvemi, S.; Jaafar, N.I. Facebook usage, socialization, and academic performance. *Comput. Educ.* 2015, 83, 64–78.

Bean, J.P. Dropouts and Turnover: The Synthesis and Test of a Causal Model of Student Attrition; Springer Link: Research in Higher Education: Urdorf, Switzerland, Volume 12, Issue 2; pp. 155–187. Available online: <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00976194> (accessed on 10 April 2022).

Brooks, S. Does personal social media usage affect efficiency and well-being? *Comput. Hum. Behav.* 2015, 46, 26–37.

Adaptation of Digital Tools in Higher Education Institutes

Camiel, D.L.; Goldman-Levine, J.; Kostka-Rokosz, M.; McCloskey, W. Twitter as a medium for pharmacy students personal learning network development. *Curr. Pharm. Teach. Learn.* 2014, 6, 463–470.

Cheung, C.; Chiu, P.; Lee, M. Online social networks Why do students use Facebook? *Comput. Hum. Behav.* 2011, 27, 1337–1343.

Dahlstrom, E.; De Boor, T.; Grunwald, P.; Vockley, M. ECAR: National Study of Undergraduate Students and Information Technology. Available online: <https://library.educause.edu/resources/2011/10/ecar-nationalstudy-of-undergraduate-students-and-information-technology-2011-report> (accessed on 10 April 2022).

Deng, N.; Tavares, J.L. From Moodle to Facebook Exploring students' motivation and experiences in online communities Students' perceptions of Facebook for academic purposes. *Comput. Educ.* 2013, 68, 167–176.

Gray, R.; Vitak, J.; Easton, E.W.; Ellison, N. Examining social adjustment to college in the age of social media Factors influencing successful transitions and persistence. *Comput. Educ.* 2013, 67, 193–207.

Hussain, I. A Study to Evaluate the Social Media Trends among University Students. *Procedia Soc. Behav. Sci.* 2012, 64, 639–645.

Kabilan, M.; Ahmad, N.; Abidin, M. Facebook: An online environment for learning English in institutions of higher education. *Internet High. Educ.* 2010, 13, 179–187.

Kelling, N.; Kelling, A.; Lennon, J. The tweets that killed a university: A case study investigating the use of traditional and social media in the closure of a state university. *Comput. Hum. Behav.* 2013, 29, 2656–2664.

Khan, T.; Kend, M.; Robertson, S. Use of social media by university accounting students and its impact on learning outcomes. *Acc. Educ.* 2016, 25, 534–567.

Kirschner, P.A.; Karpinski, A.C. Facebook and academic performance. *Comput. Hum. Behav.* 2010, 26, 1237–1245.

LaRue, E. Using Facebook as course management software: A case study. *Teach. Learn. Nurs.* 2012, 7, 17–22.

Madhusudhan, M. Use of social networking sites by research scholars of the University of Delhi: A study. *Int. Inf. Libr. Rev.* 2012, 44, 100–113.

Mazer, J.P.; Murphy, R.E.; Simonds, C.J. I'll see you on 'Facebook': The effects of computer-mediated teacher self-disclosure on student motivation, affective learning, and classroom climate. *Commun. Educ.* 2017, 56, 1–17.

Mohamad, R. The Effectiveness of Social Networking Applications in E-Learning. Available online: https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-642-24772-9_12 (accessed on 10 April 2022).

Munoz, C.; Towner, T. Opening Facebook: How to Use Facebook in the College Classroom. Available online: <https://www.learntechlib.org/primary/p/31031/> (accessed on 10 April 2022).

Michikyan, M.; Subrahmanyam, K.; Dennis, J. Facebook use and academic performance among college students—A mixed-methods study with a multi-ethnic sample. *Comput. Hum. Behav.* 2015, 45, 265–272.

Omar, H.; Embi, A.M.; Yunus, M. Learners' use of communication strategies in an online discussion via Facebook. *Procedia Soc. Behav. Sci.* 2012, 64, 535–544.

Paul, J.; Baker, H.; Cochran, J. Effect of online social networking on student academic performance. *Comput. Hum. Behav.* 2012, 28, 2117–2127.

Rosmala, F.; Rosmala, D. Study of Social Networking usage in Higher Education Environment. *Procedia Soc. Behav. Sci.* 2012, 67, 156–166.

Tess, P. The role of social media in higher education classes (real and virtual)—A literature review. *Comput. Hum. Behav.* 2013, 29, A60–A68.

Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan

Ali Ab Ul Hassan

Lecturer

School of Creative Arts, University of Lahore, Lahore,

ali.hassan@soca.uol.edu.pk

Moona Fazal

Lecturer

Department of Visual Communication Design

National College of Arts, Lahore

moona.fazal@nca.edu.pk

Syed Hussain Sajjad Rizvi

Lecturer

School of Creative Arts

The University of Lahore, Lahore

hussain.sajjad@soca.uol.edu.pk

Abstract

Advertising through Short Messaging Service (SMS) is one of the latest advertising trends in the current digital age. The purpose of the present study is to investigate the effect of SMS advertising on female consumer's buying behavior. The objective of the study was to examine the response of women in terms of purchases towards SMS advertising in the current digital scenario. The study was carried out in two steps using both the quantitative and the qualitative methods of research. The first step comprised qualitative data collection through interviews conducted by the customer care heads of five renowned clothing brands (Khaadi, Nishat, Al Karam, Ideas, and Sapphire). The second step employed the quantitative method in which 200 female respondents were selected according to their income level. The data was analyzed with statistical tools. The findings of the study reflect that women from higher economic strata, working class, and lower age groups tend to be more responsive towards renowned brands in comparison with the rest of the socio-economic groups. The study also reveals how consumers are considered to be an essential part of advertising placing customers' demands at the center of their advertising campaigns.

Keywords: *Advertising, SMS advertising, Marketing, Buying Behavior, Clothing brands*

Advertisement is a non-personal communication led by the identified sponsors through paid media. There is a range of means for execution of advertising among which have been print media, electronic media, and social media. A smartphone is a gadget that provides access to all these advertising platforms. This very (smart) phone also provides access to another service that has recently started being used as an advertising means and that service is none other than Short messages. The access provided by a smartphone to all the above-mentioned advertising means the advertising industry today perceives a smartphone as an influential factor in the process of choice-making and decision-making by consumers. This makes mobile marketing an up-to-the-minute subject and mobile manufacturing companies a participant in ecologies (Kotler, 1999). Martin Cooper Manager in 'Motorola' was the first to invent the first ever portable phone in 1973. In 90's the idea of cell phones arose across the world. When it was commercially launched only users could dial or receive calls. Then in 1991 2G (second generation) technology emerged with the

Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan

launch of a 2G cell phone in Finland. With the advancements in technology, a short messaging service (SMS) was introduced which allowed users to communicate through text messages. (Taylor & Vincent, 2015). In the beginning, SMS marketing can be expensive due to the high cost of buying mobile phone numbers. The cost for 1000 numbers is estimated as 30\$ whereas the cost for 1,000 e-mail addresses is \$ according to Forrester Research. (Andersson & Nilsson, 2000).

Bulk SMS advertising, as the name suggests, refers to the spread of advertisements through a wider number of SMS messages (short message service) to the users on their mobile phones. SMS has endless benefits for businesses which involves bulk SMS to approach customers. Marketing through SMS is way cheaper than that through digital or print media. Consumers spend more than five hours a day on their phones claims a research held in the USA. Advertising through digital or social media is also being affected by the fact that over 300 million users of mobile phones are executing the add-blocking technology for the removal of advertisements. So, it is preferable for a marketing agency/marketer to adopt a channel that is completely unharmed by any blocking technologies, and SMS advertising fits well into this criterion. Studies claimed that almost 98% of the text messages which are sent are read and even 90% of those SMS are read within 3 minutes of their delivery. This proves that a message inbox is the most effective way of communicating with the audience as being the most trusted method for mobile us

1: BRANDED SMS

An advertising SMS bearing the name of a company as the sender confirms the legitimacy of the company and enhances its credibility for customers. People consider a text message sent with the name of a reputed company more reliable and trustworthy as compared to that received from some random source. Branded SMS are more likely to make consumers listen to what an advertisement has to offer and elicit a better response from them towards the product (Dickinger & Haghirian, 2004).

2: PROBLEM STATEMENT

Advertising, like all other fields of life, goes through rapid changes in the hands of technology. The problem to be explored in this study was to examine the

ways the SMS advertising of clothing brands influences the response of customers, particularly women. How SMS advertisements attract women towards clothing by receiving a promotional marketing message. Now a day everyone receives dozens of promotional SMS daily. These messages are based on some promotions, sales, and discounts and call the recipient to buy these products in a limited time frame. These promotional messages lead the receiver to visit the outlet or online store and buy promotional products.

3: OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

1. To investigate the perception of women consumers towards SMS advertising.
2. To find out the extent of use of Short Message Service as an advertising tool in the digital age.
3. To investigate the diverse behavior of women towards SMS advertising regarding clothing brands.
4. To find out the effect of demographic factors on their buying behavior of shopping.

4: REVIEW OF LITERATURE

Javed (2015) stated that SMS is the best source for advertising as its being the new trend of the current era which is not only technologically advanced but also speedy and fast in all fields including communication and marketing. Current literature on the subject tends to explore a variety of relevant factors when it comes to the question of how and in what ways SMS advertising may affect the behavior of buyers. These include not only explicit factors like consumers' age, education, and gender; their access to the internet; advertisers' goals and resources, but those factors as well which may not seem directly linked to the subject at first glance but are likely to share an influence in an indirect way examples of which can be ethical values of a buying community. The present study confined itself to the review of the literature which can serve to provide an insight into how SMS advertising is received by female consumers in terms of their shopping responses and if any particular socioeconomic or age groups are more responsive towards SMS advertising as compared to the rest. While going through the literature on SMS advertising it is pertinent to remember that mobile trade and the ongoing development of the telecommunication industry in

Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan

Pakistan is one of the largest economies in the world. Due to its huge increased traffic and being the cheapest way to convey messages, SMS is considered to be the best way to approach consumers. Hence marketers and businessmen use SMS as their preferred tool for selling and even promoting their brands. In another study, Bakr et al. (2018) attempted to recognize and discover the background or experiences regarding the acceptance and effects of SMS advertising. This study figured the two elements or two types of advertisements discount and notification advertisements. The results clarified that the elements that could completely change the attitude of customers towards SMS advertising in a negative direction included common assumptions about SMS advertising and lack of trust in the advertisement or the source through which advertising was done. The main elements that could be beneficial in gaining the trust and attention of the consumers included relevance, better content, brand impartiality, and brand discounted offers.

Zhang (2008) stressed the perception of youngsters in China towards SMS advertising and mobile marketing practices. He derived two following elements that can better serve as beneficial for a marketer and comforting for a consumer: usefulness and relevance without being irritating. Further is predicted that an advertising message would be beneficial if it is trustworthy and meets the personal satisfaction or values of the consumer.

Aamir et al. (2015) explored in their research paper that the reception or acceptance of SMS marketing can be better protected by the users' agreement because users or consumers are the main focus of the process and they can play a vital role in the success of SMS marketing. This study was held in Pakistan and was based on qualitative research. Findings suggested that marketers must not send SMS advertisements at a huge amount to the users without their permission. It was also recommended that SMS advertisements must not be frequent and there must be a specific time to send SMS advertisements, marketers must avoid sending SMS randomly to the users and it must be controlled. SMS advertisements should also be checked for spam. In addition to this, Mansour (2012) concluded in his research paper that mobile advertising applications nowadays are flourishing in the mobile trade, and mainly mobile advertising is nourishing in the form of SMS advertising.

The uttermost motive of this study was to examine the perception and response of the people of Sudan toward SMS marketing. The results were mostly positive as users were comfortable receiving SMS advertisements on their mobile phones although they were concerned about giving their data to advertising companies. The study also showed that people wanted SMS advertising to be relevant, less frequent, and more promotions from the companies to avail by the customers.

Antu (2017) discovered and theorized how Bangladeshi marketers remarkably developed a new trend of advertising through Bulk SMS to promote their products and services. This study reveals how marketers approach their customers through SMS which is a cheap yet so far most effective way of marketing for both small and large size businesses in Bangladesh. The main purpose of this study was to get a better understanding of Bulk SMS marketing done by Robi Axiata Limited and to know about their promotion of services and products through SMS marketing to their users. Three major factors to change the perception of consumers about Bulk SMS marketing recognized by secondary sources were enlarged or amplified regularity of Bulk SMS, customer's perception (dependent factor), the relevance of the message for the individual customer, and the age of the customer SMS is being sent. Results proved that age and amplified regularity of SMS were two leading variables that had a deep effect on the perception of the consumers towards SMS marketing of numerous products and services provided by Robi Axiata Limited.

Bamba & J. Barnes (2007) stated that the purpose of their study was to investigate the readiness of consumers to permit to receive SMS advertisements. The study had three goals as follows: to provide a better understanding of consumers' readiness to receive SMS advertisements, to provide practical data that should help understand this phenomenon, and to test as well as develop the basic model of consumers' readiness of permitting to receive SMS advertisements. Results showed that even the advertisement having significance does not mean that it makes a consumer permit unless it is pooled with control and the conditions of reception are determined to ensure the consumers' permission.

Khakhan & Siddiqui (2015) explored the viewpoint of women towards clothing in Pakistan. They found four major factors that attracted women naming Quality, Values, Traditions, and Status. The purpose of the study was to discover how

Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan

mentioned above elements help them create an emotional affection for the branded clothes and how these elements encourage them to purchase.

Hashim, Normalini, & Sajali (2018) highlighted the place consumers' demands and needs possess in the field of SMS advertising. The credibility of the SMS in the eye of the consumer has become necessary to be taken into account by the advertisers. The attitudes of the consumers are linked to the information shared and the label carried by the SMS. Usually, by an anonymous SMS, the consumers get annoyed and do not consider it as the representative of a trustworthy brand. If consumers get attracted towards the SMS it changes their buying behavior towards that specific brand. Apart from that, Brosekhan & Velayuthum (2005) narrated that the consumer is the basic necessity in marketing as marketers design their strategies to satisfy and fulfill the demands of the consumer. There are two paradigms important in the field of marketing namely positivist and non-positivist. The former is based on the traditional point of view that the consumer adopts from its surroundings. The latter is based on the modern perspective which is although still less dominant. The researcher has highlighted the different perspectives and thought processes of consumers so that it can help marketers achieve their goals.

5: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The theoretical framework of this study has been taken from the Multi-Attribute Attitude model proposed by Fishbein in 1975. This model claims that the attributes of the consumers' attitudes reflect their values and norms. Attitude in turn influences the behavior of the customers and can change their decisions and perceptions in either way. The model proposes that the perception and behavior of the consumer can be changed by providing accurate information about the particular product. The reason for this study to take its framework by this model is the shared belief in consumer's attitude. Both the model and this research align themselves with consumer's attitudes.

6: RESEARCH QUESTION

1. Does SMS advertising motivate women to shop more after receiving SMS?
2. What is the perception of women consumers towards SMS advertisements in the digital age?

3. Do women use SMS advertising as a reference for purchase?
4. Can women consider SMS advertising as a trustworthy and authentic tool so that they can trust even new brands?

7: METHOD

This study was carried out in two steps. The first step followed the qualitative method of research and comprised five interviews with sales and marketing heads of five renowned clothing brands in Pakistan to learn about the consumer's response towards SMS advertising. All the five brands had their head offices in Lahore. The second step was designed to examine the attitude of female consumers towards SMS advertising. For this purpose, a structured questionnaire was used to find out the comparisons between consumers concerning different factors. The data was analyzed on SPSS software to extract from it the research findings. The statistics tests have been applied to the results to find out the frequencies and percentages of the variables. Apart from demographics questions, the Likert scale (1-strongly disagree to 5-strongly agree) was applied to all the questions. There were two tables in the questionnaire that were used to analyze the behavior of consumers towards SMS advertising and the effects of SMS advertising on women. For the data collection, 200 women in Lahore were chosen above the age of 20. They all were categorized by their marital status, occupation, qualification, and monthly income. The women who were selected for the research had enough knowledge about clothing brands and received advertising messages from clothing brands. For the qualitative data collection, the clothing brands selected for the research were Nishat Linen, Sapphire, Khaadi, Ideas, Alkarm, and Generation. They all are well-known brands in Pakistan and use SMS marketing as a medium to give information to consumers.

8: RESULTS

8.1 Step 1

As mentioned in the above discussion about the method of this research, there were two steps. In the first step of the study, five questions were designed to be asked from the Customer Care Heads of the selected brands. The questions were kept open-ended so that qualitative data could be extracted from the responses. The answers are recorded in the order they were asked.

Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan

Question 1: Does your brand still focus on SMS advertising in this digital age?

The customer care head of Ideas said that they consider SMS advertising as an effective tool for advertising, especially for those who are not addicted to social platforms. He said, “We have to fulfill the needs of the customers in every way. The whole staff who is sitting outside my cabin works hard to fulfill the demands of the customers and to resolve their issues and to answer their queries.”

Answering the same question, the customer care head of Nishat Linen revealed that their main focus in marketing is the social media platforms because SMS is a one-way communication tool and customers cannot give instant responses. But despite that, they still use the SMS advertising medium because if anyone does not have internet access then the best mode of communication is through SMS. This is why they still consider SMS advertising as an essential tool if not the preferred one.

Moreover, the customer care head of Alkarm studio also revealed their belief in the necessity of SMS advertising saying, “This is the era of public and competition, today we cannot ignore the consumer responses while we know that they can simply fulfill their demands and needs from other brands. Nowadays, competition between brands become tough because each brand is working hard to satisfy the consumer, it's not about us or the brand, it's about consumers, and because of that we use the SMS platform in the same way as well as social media platforms.”

Sapphire's motive is articulated in the words of the customer's head, “Almost 61% of Pakistan's population belongs to rural areas, so to hit those areas we use SMS advertising. A huge number of customers are from rural areas which we cannot deny, and can we ignore the fact that every customer doesn't have access to social media but they are our loyal customers. Therefore, it's our utmost duty to satisfy their needs and to inform them about the updates.

Question 2: What are the strategies you use to send SMS advertisements?

The customer care head of Nishat Linen said that if an advertising SMS becomes personalized then the customers cannot be annoyed by it even when sent at midnight. The custom-made strategy is the best strategy to communicate with the consumers.

They receive messages that start with their name and thus they feel special and consider themselves loyal customers of the brand.

The customer care head of Ideas added some points to the strategies of SMS advertising. He was of the view that a personalized SMS enables the brand to create an association with consumers. They send SMS on different occasions like Independence Day, Eid, or other national holidays through which they can create a special bond with their customers. The other heads had the same response towards this question, almost all famous brands use these kinds of strategies in their SMS to make a better relationship with their customers.

Question 3: What factors do you think are important in SMS advertising?

While interacting with the interviewer, the Alkarm customer care head stated that the most essential factor in any SMS advertising is the content of that SMS. He said “In the hectic routine of a person, no one has time to read irrelevant SMS and he/she can easily get irritated whether it is an SMS advertisement or an advertising notification from Facebook or Instagram. This is why we have to be much more careful about our advertising content. We make sure that the content is not irrelevant or annoying, we can communicate with our customers in a few but effective words. Another reason which, I think, can easily get the customer irritated is the random SMS advertisements. This has now become the trend that every small business, retail shop, or service Centre can easily have access to mobile numbers and this is why most people ignore the SMS or delete it without reading. So, it is important to send an appropriate advertisement to consumers.”

The same response came from Sapphire, its customer care head said, “The trust of consumers is very important for everyone whether it is a clothing brand or an automobile company. We spend years gaining the trust of the consumers and thankfully, through our several years of hard work, our customers respond positively at every platform. She added, “If a brand shares a special bond with its customers then we do not have to face any issues of trust, loyalty, etc. I believe that the content in an advertisement is an essential factor and we also create the content based on our customers’ feedback. And also if the consumers consider you a trustworthy brand then they cannot be annoyed by your SMS advertisement.” On the other hand, the response from the interviewee Nishat Linen brought up the idea of the importance of

Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan

time in the discussion. She remarked, “In 2004, when social media was not introduced and SMS advertising was the primary tool of communication, we surveyed to find out the appropriate time to send an SMS advertisement. From that survey, we concluded that an SMS advertisement sent at the wrong time affects the relationship between the customer and the brand. So, time is as important in advertising as content.”

Question 4: Do you send SMS to your loyal and regular customers or randomly?

Nishat Linen, as its customer care head shared, provides lists of mobile numbers to its marketing teams according to their respective areas. Although they send their SMS advertisements on regular numbers belonging to posh areas the main target audience consists of the users having golden or silver numbers. This is because their price ranges are higher as compared to other brands and their loyal customers are mostly from the posh areas. They also send SMS to random public but on a minor level. He claimed that their brand has been known since the 70s for its cloth and is a famous brand in the textile industry this leaves their marketing team with a bigger community of regular customers to satisfy, so they have to often confine their SMS advertising to their regular and loyal customers and they need not extend it to random users.

Ideas, on the contrary to Nishat, have the opposite policy. Its customer care head revealed that they have contracts with mobile network companies that provide them with lists of mobile numbers in different areas of Lahore. Unlike Nishat, they target women of each category by randomly sending SMS advertisements. He added, “A few years back, our brand hesitated to use this strategy of random marketing because then, people can have privacy issues, particularly women. But now as I said before it is the age of social media and most of the public has no issues with brands. Every small company or business uses different types of platforms for marketing so this is no big deal for anyone now to receive marketing messages.”

Question 5: What are the drawbacks and limitations of SMS advertising?

The interviewee Nishat Linen said, “The major drawback of SMS advertising is that it is a one-way communication medium and the consumers cannot give instant responses. WhatsApp is a modest form of SMS advertising if we talk about only SMS or mobile advertising. Because it can be visually effective for the consumers and can

also communicate or resolve their issues through videos or images. Another factor that I consider to be important is that it is much cheaper than SMS advertising. No doubt that SMS advertising is an effective tool for communication and has many positive sides but if the consumers have internet access then they prefer WhatsApp over SMS.” On the contrary, the Sapphire customer care head responded differently, she said that there is no comparison between SMS and WhatsApp. Both have different benefits and drawbacks in their respective zones. Nowadays, no brand can take a risk to choose between advertising platforms. All brands use each platform to build a relationship with the consumers.

The Ideas interviewee said that most consumers ignore SMS advertisements because for various reasons they consider it annoying and this is the major drawback of SMS advertising. This is why, it is considered to be the least effective tool of marketing. Usually, consumers use online shopping methods because it gives them detailed

Table 1: CORRELATION BETWEEN PRODUCTS AND PROMOTIONAL WORDS

| | Words like discounted offers, sales, and promotions grab your attention | Buy the products from the store |
|---|---|---------------------------------|
| Words like discounted offers, sales, and promotions grab your attention | 1 | .360* |
| Pearson Correlation | | .023 |
| Sig. (2-tailed) | | |
| N | 200 | 200 |
| Buy the products from the store | .360* | 1 |
| Pearson Correlation | | |
| Sig. (2-tailed) | .023 | |
| N | 200 | 200 |

*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

information about that particular product.

8.2 Step 2

Step 2 of the research was designed to gather quantitative data, the respondents were categorized based on age, occupation, income, qualification level, and marital status. The total number of respondents was 200 which were all females.

The above-mentioned correlation matrix indicates that there is a positive and significant relationship present among the sales, promotion, and discounted base words towards the buying trends from physical stores instead of online. This shows when the businesses use various eye-capturing words like 'discount up to x' or 'flat discount', buy one get one free, etc. Persuade the consumers to purchase their required goods and services from the nearby physical retail outlets instead of only means. This reflects that a direct relation is present among these two variables of research. When the entrepreneur invests more in such eye-capturing and attractive words of marketing and promotion, then the buyer's trend to buy from physical stores goes up automatically.

Table 2: Correlation Between Statements

| | Do you receive any kind of SMS regarding clothing brands? | The content of clothing brands' SMS is informative | Visit the store | Buy the products from the store |
|---|---|--|-----------------------|---------------------------------|
| Do you receive any kind of SMS regarding clothing brands? | Pearson Correlation 1 200 | | | |
| The content of clothing brands' SMS is informative | Pearson Correlation .444** (2-tailed) N 200 | 1 200 | | |
| Visit the store | Pearson Correlation .450** (2-tailed) N 200 | .650** .000 200 | 1 200 | |
| Buy the products from the store | Pearson Correlation .380* (2-tailed) N 200 | .550** .000 200 | .885** .000 200 | 1 200 |

The entire above-mentioned correlation matrix indicates that every variable of research holds a direct and positive relationship with others. This means that any change, either positive or negative, in any of the research variables mentioned above, automatically brings the same change in the remaining variables as well. Thus any

Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan

investment in any of these variables can for sure bring an upward increase towards the entire research variables. This reflects that clothing brands exercise huge SMS-based marketing techniques which enable them to be aware of the existing and potential customers of new promotion offers, discount offers, and sale offers introduced by the business. This persuades the customers to visit the physical stores of businesses instead of online business and shopping. Thus the number of physical store visitors and inflow of customers goes up automatically.

The behavior of homemakers, working women, and students towards the message of different clothing brands in Pakistan.

Table 3: FREQUENCY BETWEEN OCCUPATIONS OF RESPONDENTS

You shop on receiving SMS advertisements without a single thought

| Occupation | Strongly disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly agree |
|---------------|-------------------|------------|---------|-------|----------------|
| House wives | 18 | Housewives | 14 | 15 | 2 |
| Working women | 15 | 26 | 26 | 14 | 0 |
| Students | 11 | 10 | 15 | 3 | 1 |
| Total | 44 | 66 | 55 | 32 | 3 |

In this question, the respondents were asked about the trend and behavior of impulsive buying stimulated by SMS advertisements. The respondents were asked about how their buying behavior and decision changed immediately whenever they got an SMS regarding an advertisement for any product or service. For this, the entire three groups responded in three different directions. For this, 30% of Housewives opted for disagree responses, 18% strongly disagreed, and 14% & 15% of respondents went for neutral and agreed responses respectively.

Working women gave an equal response of disagreeing and Neutral by 26% towards this statement, and 15% and 14% of respondents responded strongly disagree and

agree. From a student's perspective, 11%, 10 %, 15%, and 3% of respondents chose strongly disagree, disagree, neutral, and agree on responses respectively.

Overall, the majority of all respondents held a cumulative disagree response over it. This reflects that one SMS advertisement never persuades them to buy that specific product and service.

Table 4: Frequency of Statement Regarding Occupation

People's opinion is important, more important than SMS advertisement

| Occupation | Strongly disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly agree | Total |
|---------------|-------------------|----------|---------|-------|----------------|-------|
| Housewife | 5 | 9 | 13 | 41 | 11 | 79 |
| Working woman | 4 | 4 | 18 | 41 | 14 | 81 |
| Student | 3 | 2 | 13 | 15 | 7 | 40 |
| Total | 12 | 15 | 44 | 97 | 32 | 200 |

For this statement, the respondents were asked about the importance and influence of other existing customers' views and responses over their buying decisions instead of an SMS advertisement. For housewives, 41% and 11% of respondents Agree and strongly agree on response on this statement. For a working woman, 41% and 14% of respondents picked Agree and strongly agree on responses mainly. As per the student's view, 13% of respondents and 15% of respondents gave Neutral and agreed responses.

Overall, this variation in responses reflects that other people's views and perceptions directly affect female consumers' buying behavior up to a great extent instead of SMS advertisements.

Table 5: Frequency and Cumulative Frequency

Do you think mobile advertising can be used as a reference for buying clothes?

| | Frequency | Percent | Valid Percent | Cumulative Percent |
|--|-----------|---------|---------------|--------------------|
|--|-----------|---------|---------------|--------------------|

Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan

| | | | | |
|-------------------|-----|-------|-------|-------|
| Strongly disagree | 3 | 1.5 | 1.5 | 1.5 |
| Disagree | 7 | 3.5 | 3.5 | 5.0 |
| Neutral | 50 | 25.0 | 25.0 | 30.0 |
| Agree | 109 | 54.5 | 54.5 | 84.5 |
| Strongly agree | 31 | 15.5 | 15.5 | 15.5 |
| Total | 200 | 100.0 | 100.0 | 100.0 |

In this question, the respondents were asked about how the various advertisements received through mobile phones influence the buying decision of clothes among women. In the current highly advanced world of IT, the use of smartphones is increasing day by day. Along with this, the ubiquity of the internet makes it possible for producers or advertisers to spread awareness about any product or service at any time. 54.5% of respondents agreed with the statement and 25% respondent's responded as Neutral. Besides this, 15.5% of respondents strongly agreed with the response. This reflects that mobile advertising techniques and strategies directly influence women's cloth-buying decisions.

Table 6: Frequency and Cumulative Frequency

SMS advertisements are beneficial to consumers because it gives them information about products or services

| | Frequency | Percent | Valid Percent | Cumulative Percent |
|-------------------|-----------|---------|---------------|--------------------|
| Strongly disagree | 5 | 2.5 | 2.5 | 2.5 |
| Disagree | 7 | 3.5 | 3.5 | 6.0 |
| Neutral | 34 | 17.0 | 17.0 | 23.0 |
| Agree | 136 | 68.0 | 68.0 | 91.0 |
| Strongly agree | 18 | 9.0 | 9.0 | 100.0 |
| Total | 200 | 100.0 | 100.0 | 2.5 |

In this statement, the respondents were asked about the extent of awareness, knowledge, and information spread by SMS advertisements among the customers. Through SMS advertisement, one can easily know about the features offered by a

business in its product portfolio and the extent of diversity present in the product portfolio of a business as well. To this statement, 68% of respondents chose the agree option in response. 17% and 9% of respondents gave neutral and strongly agreed responses on this statement, respectively. This reflects that SMS-based advertisement brings more information about business products and services to its valued customers.

9. DISCUSSION

In this era of advanced marketing, advertising has become an essential part of every business be it the corporate sector or the small retailers. The public is persuaded by advertisements through various platforms like social media, electronic media Text messages, etc. As far as the subject of the study in hand, SMS advertising, there is a large public which, with the emergence of social media not more than a decade before, no longer considers SMS advertisement authentic no matter the source it comes from a famous clothing brand or an anonymous retailer. Yet the existence of a community with no access to social media is still very much there. For this community SMS advertisement holds as much importance as any other medium used for advertising. Since every argument or claim needs evidence to be treated as a fact, the findings of this research come up with evidence that brings into light the reasons for SMS advertising to still hold importance as well as relevance despite the powerful presence of social media. This study helps reveal the reasons which prevent social media marketing replace SMS advertising altogether. But that's not the limit and the only purpose of the research rather the establish the fact that SMS advertising is important and serves as a base and a foundation for the actual purpose of the study which was to explore the trends manifested in the purchase behavior of female buyers towards SMS advertising. This discussion, therefore, intends to further interpret the findings that account for how SMS advertising affects purchase behaviors towards clothing brands, of female buyers in particular. In this research, a questionnaire was designed to find out the responses of the potential consumers about SMS advertisements regarding clothing brands, and interviews with customer care heads of famous clothing brands were conducted to know the kind of responses they received from consumers to their SMS or otherwise advertisements. The findings provide evidence that supports SMS advertising and helps conclude that SMS advertising increases the purchase of a brand and holds an important place in the advertising strategies of the business. The findings establish that SMS advertising has not been

Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan

replaced by social media advertising and it elicits positive purchase responses from female buyers.

The study reveals that advertising in this century has turned into a two-way communication, between the producer and the consumer, with the progress in communication technologies including SMS and the rest. This not only facilitates the producer's understanding of the needs and demands of the potential customer rather also makes him realize that this very understanding is the key to successful advertising with the consumer at its center.

Every brand makes use of SMS advertising as they consider it the basic and powerful tool for changing the shopping behavior of consumers. Owners are never satisfied with the idea of their brand being confined to some particular areas and they always strive to find ways to extend their sales even in rural areas or areas with less or no internet access hence, the relevant channel of marketing in those areas is none other than SMS advertising. The brands believe that if the SMS is personalized it could grab more attention of the customers. For instance, if the name of the consumer is mentioned in the SMS by the known brand consumer will be attracted emotionally towards that brand which could help the brands to change the shopping behavior of consumers.

On the other hand, it is also very important that the message must be relevant and must not be sent so frequently that consumers get irritated. If consumer gets irritated by the SMS advertising it would put in danger the image of even a very well-known brand. However, despite all its benefits, SMS advertising, like every other technique, does not come without its limitations. To begin with, one among them is it's one-way communication failing to get a response back, good or bad. Another limitation of SMS advertising, which is very basic, lies in its inability to send visuals while such media exists as capable of attracting the attention of consumers through sharing visuals to attract the consumer's attention, this limitation can bring SMS advertising down in the priority list of consumers.

While considering the attitudes of consumers, it was explored in this research that positive and negative feelings about an advertisement come from whether they take it as authentic and informative or perceive it as annoying and untruthful. Another main

point discovered is that consumers prefer SMS from known and famous brands as compared to unknown retailers and less popular brands.

This study also attempted to compare the level of interest in SMS advertisements of working women and housewives and found that working women have more interest in SMS advertisements as compared to housewives and students. But, interestingly, at the same time, it is the housewives who are much more manipulated by SMS advertisements and have a catchy vocabulary as compared to working women who, as per the findings, are less manipulated by SMS advertisements and their manipulative vocabulary. Apart from that, consumers believe that SMS advertisements can be used as a reference for shopping, they can be trusted equally as any other medium of advertisement. It is suggested that the companies should focus on the delivery time of their SMS and the privacy of the consumers. It was pointed out in the results that many consumers are concerned about the wrong timing of the SMS delivery which annoys them.

Both steps have shown the positive as well as negative sides of SMS advertising regarding clothing brands. No doubt, SMS advertising has been an effective tool since it was introduced but with the advent of digital media, it has become less popular and effective. Another reason why SMS advertising of clothing brands has become less effective is the increasing number of anonymous SMS advertisements. Nowadays, even small businesses and retailers have access to mobile numbers and they also adopt this medium for marketing. This is why most people get annoyed by SMS advertising and they regularly receive SMS in large figures daily.

10. CONCLUSION

After the discussion already made above on the findings of the study it seems quite satisfying to present a conclusion as precise as possible. Hence it is concluded hereby in the form of the following points which are meant to serve objectivity, clarity, and precision to the maximum possible extent:

1. SMS advertising in the current times is consumer centered shaping itself on the needs and demands of consumers.
2. Means of successful SMS advertising are precision, relevance, and culturally appropriate timing of SMS delivery.

Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan

3. SMS advertising is neither the most relevant nor the left out form of advertising rather one of the relevant and prevailing forms of advertising.
4. Working-class female consumers are more inclined towards yet less manipulated by SMS advertisements.
5. Housewives are less inclined towards but much manipulated by SMS advertisements.
6. The factors hampering the effectiveness of SMS advertisements include its inability to send visuals and attain feedback.
7. In the end, it is pertinent to suggest the need for formulation of a policy for SMS advertising that may pay sufficient attention to precision and relevance in the text of the advertisement, appropriate timing of its delivery, cautiousness about consumer's privacy, and check on the frequency and number of texts messages delivered to consumers.

REFERENCES

- Aamir, S., Malik, R. K., Yasir, M., Ullah, M., & Ahmad, S. (2015). Mobile Marketing: Acceptance of SMS ads in Pakistan. *VFAST transactions on education and Social Sciences*, 6(1), 39-49. Retrieved from [@ 2013 ISSN: 2309-3951](http://www.vfast.org/index.php/VTESS)
- Andersson, A., & Nilsson, J. (2000). *Wireless Advertising Effectiveness: Evaluation of an SMS Advertising Trial*. Retrieved from Semantic Scholar: <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/c6f0/79243c47313fb2bae93398a4651483f186ee.pdf>
- Antu, F. I. (2017). *Consumer perception towards Bulk SMS for the marketing of various products/services of Robi Axiata Limited*. Retrieved from BRAC University Institutional Repository: <http://dspace.bracu.ac.bd/xmlui/handle/10361/8772>
- Bakr, Y., Tolba, A., & Meshreki, H. (2018). Drivers of SMS advertising acceptance: a mixed-method approach. *Journal of reseach in interactive marketing*, 13(1), 96-118. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1108/JRIM-02-2018-0033>
- Bamba, F., & J. Barnes, S. (2007). SMS advertising, permission, and the consumer. *Business Process Management Journal*, 815-829. doi:10.1108/14637150710834578
- Brosekhan, A., & Velayuthum, D. M. (2005). Consumer Buying Behavior- A literature review. *Journal of Business and Management*, 8-16. Retrieved from www.iosrjournals.org
- Dickinger, A., & Haghirian, P. (2004). An investigation and Conceptual Model of SMS Marketing. *Proceedings of the 37th Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences*, 1-10. Retrieved from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.96.7280&rep=rep1&type=pdf>
- Fishben, M., & ajzen, I. (1977). Attitude-behavior relations: A theoretical analysis and review of empirical research. *Psychological Bulletin*, 888-918. Retrieved

Impact of SMS Advertising on Female Consumer's Buying Behavior in Pakistan

from

https://shodhganga.inflibnet.ac.in/bitstream/10603/45148/9/09_chapter%202.pdf

Hashim, N. H., Normalini, & Sajali, N. (2018). The Influence Factor towards Mobile Advertising Messaging Content. *Global Business Review*, 19(5), 1-20. doi:10.1177/0972150918788746

Javed, A. (2015). Attitude of Pakistani Consumers towards SMS. *International Journal of Sciences: Basic and Applied Research*, 9, 124-136.

Khakhan, M., & Siddiqui, K. (2015). *Womens's perception towards branded clothing in Pakistan*. Retrieved from Research Gate: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/285982480_WOMEN'S_PERCEPTIONS_TOWARDS_BRANDED_CLOTHING_IN_PAKISTAN

Kotler, P. (1999). Mass Communications: Advertising, Sales Promotion, and Public Relations. In P. Kotler, *Principles of Marketing* (p. 793). Retrieved from http://pc-freak.net/international_university_college_files/Philip%20Kotler%20-%20Principles%20Of%20Marketing.pdf

Mansour, I. H. (2012). Consumers' perception and responsiveness to bulk SMS advertising in Sudan. *Gezira Journal of Economic & Social Science*, 33-49. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/268750431_Consumers_Perception_and_Responsiveness_to_Bulk_SMS_Advertising_in_the_Sudan

Taylor, A. S., & Vincent, J. (2015). An SMS History. *Mobile world: Past, present and future*, 75-91. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/226340906_An_SMS_history

Zhang, J. (2008). *Understanding the acceptance of mobile SMS advertising among young Chinese consumers*. Retrieved from Wiley online library: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/mar.20239>

Authors' Guidelines

A. Frequency of Publication

Pakistan Journal of Mass Communication (PJMC) publishes two issues a year.

A. Guidelines for Submission of Research Articles

1. Authors are required to follow the ethical guidelines by making sure that any research they submit to the journal must be original to them and cannot be submitted or presented for publication elsewhere.
2. Translated words and terminologies in English must be properly spelled according to the standard dictionaries.
3. Authors' must submit a plagiarism report (Turnitin) along with the manuscript according to HEC plagiarism policy, a maximum of 19% similarity index is allowed.
4. Every manuscript that is submitted to the journal for publication will be initially screened by the Editor/Editorial Board to determine the relevance of research with the scope of the journal. After initial screening, accepted manuscripts will undergo a double-blind peer review process. Reviewer's comments will be shared with the author and in case of recommended revision, the author will be given the time to make changes and re-submit the work. After the comprehensive screening process, acceptance or rejection will be communicated to the corresponding author.
5. The declaration form and the authors' permission must be uploaded separately from the manuscript and title page.
6. A title page that includes the names of the authors, their institutional affiliation, their contact information, and any acknowledgments or declarations of conflict of interest (if any) needs to be uploaded independently of the manuscript.
7. Authors must upload their manuscripts without including any personal information about themselves, their institutions, or anything else that might identify them.
8. English-language manuscripts should be submitted to the journal as an A4-sized Microsoft Word document with a 12-point Times New Roman font and a word count of 5000–7000. It ought to be sent via the site rather than email.

9. A 200–250 word abstract should be formatted as a synopsis that highlights the goals, theoretical underpinnings, methods, and key findings. There shouldn't be any citations in the abstract.
10. The article needs to be formatted correctly, with citations included, using the APA style (7th edition).
11. In a single issue, an author is only permitted to publish one article.
12. The manuscript must be submitted online at the journal's website along with a concise cover letter that includes the article's title, the authors' names, their institutional affiliations, their corresponding authors' contact information, and any other information the author wishes to share about their research.
13. An article may have up to three authors or collaborators.
14. All charts, pictures, graphs, and drawings utilized in the study project must be assembled in a format suitable for printing. Verify that the number and caption on each page are marked following APA format.
15. Tables need to be well-labeled and readable.
16. Writers need to be aware that, unless the Editor or Editorial Board grants permission in certain circumstances, no research article can be removed after it has undergone peer review.
17. Although researcher/s give the journal publication rights, the writers retain copyright to their published research articles. Please take note that PJMC disclaims all liability for any use of this work that may be made in the future.
18. The Editor/Editorial Board has the right to make minor changes and edit the draft (with the permission of the author/s), ask for revision, or even reject the paper on quality issues/scope of the journal.



Issue 02
PJMC

ISSN: 3008-119X (Print)

ISSN: 3078-4298 (Online)

PAKISTAN JOURNAL OF MASS COMMUNICATION

Pakistan Journal of Mass Communication is a multidisciplinary, bi-annual, and blind-reviewed publication available online and in print. The Institute of Media and Communication Studies (IMCS), Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan planned to publish this journal in 2020. PJMC is addressed to the national and international scholarly community; it seeks to reflect various intellectual traditions in communication to promote debate and dialogue among them.

PJMC accepts research papers, critical essays, and book reviews related to communication worldwide. In pursuing this objective, we encourage empirical, theoretical, and methodological research papers that can contribute to advancing communication studies as a multi-disciplinary field. PJMC firmly believes in the cumulative nature of productive knowledge. Hence, we especially encourage research papers from diverse resources based on systematic reviews, meta-analyses, and synthesis. The journal promotes research on the work connected with media, communication, politics, religion, history, sociology, economy, new media, advertising, and special emphasis on Pakistan.

**INSTITUTE OF MEDIA AND COMMUNICATION STUDIES
BAHAUDDIN ZAKARIYA UNIVERSITY, MULTAN, PAKISTAN**